Chapter Six

Lessons Learned

1. **Observation**: The Bank-wide Learning Process defines participation as: "a process by which people, especially disadvantaged people, influence decisions that affect them" (Bhatnagar and Williams 1992: 177). Although the sector analyses did find examples of this type of "ideal" participation, the sector analyses highlight that the concept has meant many things to different actors at different times.

In the colonial period, the state's definition of "participation" was forced labor.

Since independence, "participation" has frequently been used to refer to the beneficiaries' contribution of labor to construct basic infrastructure that authorities have deemed to be in their collective interest. Examples include the "commando" constructions of urban housing projects and village health posts during the revolution, and the use of "free" village labor to build boutiques, wells, cereal banks, and wells in the 1970s' community development projects.

Beneficiaries have participated financially through pooling funds to establish village pharmacies, savings and loan cooperatives, and basic infrastructure. The beneficiaries of the UNDP Habitat Project, the Dutch-sponsored MAP, and the World Bank-sponsored First Urban Project paid a high proportion of the actual costs of developing the improved land plots.

The third category of participation, broadly defined as "intellectual participation" (and more closely resembling the World Bank's definition of participation) occurred during the Cissin urban development programs (both the UNDP Habitat project and the World Bank-supported First Urban Project) and the World Bank-sponsored Third Urban Project's pilot project to develop sanitation services.

While complete participation (intellectual, physical, and financial) is the best, it is also the most complex because it involves all of the actors at all of phases of a project (conceptualization, execution, and management). For all of these reasons, this concept has been the most difficult to achieve.

The different levels of participation make it easy to overlook the need to "operationalize" a project's good intentions in a series of appropriate institutions and procedures. This lack of precision makes it difficult to evaluate what has or has not been achieved. Faso Baara is an example of a project that was criticized for being insufficiently "participatory" in its mid-term evaluation, even though the project was defined primarily as a tool for executing policies that the urban governments had identified and conceptualized in a participatory fashion.

Many of the current models to promote "true" participation are revised versions of earlier models that achieved more "partial" types of participation. For example, the government's slow but steady progress toward the development of a decentralized health system in which the village health committees will be responsible for the elaboration and implementation of the local policies (fees charged, financial management, physical maintenance, and in-kind support for the village health agents). Profiting from the six years of experience of the Pilot National Program for Village Land Management (PNGTV), the planning documents for the follow-up PNGT project include a detailed model for incorporating and evaluating local participation (World Bank, AF5AG 1991, 1993). In much the same way the highly participatory Third Urban Project is a outgrowth of earlier evaluations of what did and did not work in the First and Second Urban Projects.

***Recommendation**: Planners need to clarify the forms and objectives of participation in planning documents. These objectives must be clearly defined in operational terms and, whenever possible, aspire for a "complete" model of participation--intellectual, financial and physical.*

***Recommendation**: Use pilot projects to test plans. Experience shows that "complete" participation is easier to elaborate when the project model for participation is tested through operational research (pilot projects) or builds on an evaluation of previous experience.*

2. **Observation**: The sectoral analyses emphasize that in the current atmosphere of development in Burkina Faso, the evolution toward "true" community participation is not perceived as a luxury but as an absolute necessity by government officials, technicians, the beneficiary population, and donors.

The initial impetus for the Burkinabè government to develop new institutional models to promote "true" participation was strongly influenced by outside donors like UNDP, the Dutch, WHO, and UNICEF. This is changing. Increasingly the national government is motivated by their own assessment of what did and did not work in earlier projects. Examples of this include the Second Urban Project and Faso Baara's recognition that populations are less able to properly use new sanitation and drainage infrastructure if they don't understand its operation. Another example is the government's recognition that in the absence of voluntary compliance with woodcutting regulations, the only way to control illegal wood cutting was through expensive top-down policing tactics that the state could ill afford.

There are numerous instances in which the local population was willing to invest in participatory projects where they saw some clear, demonstrated benefit. In several cases projects contributed to the "liberation" of some of the society's low-income, impoverished groups by giving them their first secure access to an improved urban site, crop input credits, basic literacy, and/or modern health care.

Recommendation: *The concept of community participation must be seen as an essential ingredient of development and as a potential mechanism for emancipating the least favored groups.*

3. **Observation**: All too often planners focus on the role of participation in reducing costs. This attitude can lead to project designs that are not sustainable within the wider socio-economic and administrative context. For example, close to 600 of the schools that were constructed as part of the PPD never received school teachers. Similarly, a very high percentage of PSPs ran out of drugs within six months of construction. In the urban sector, the low cost "commando" land allocation programs increased the supply of urban parcels, but these did not always translate into higher living standards due to the lack of support infrastructure.

Recommendation: *Participatory projects must be conceptualized within the larger national, socio-economic context that is essential to sustain them.*

4. **Observation**: Community participation is a long, dynamic process.

The most successful examples of sustainable participatory approaches were characterized by a long period of apprenticeship during which a community could familiarize itself with a new technology or vision of the world that was categorically different from its historic cultural universe. This principal of "apprenticeship" is not always understood by World Bank administrators and task managers who are often forced to respect a pre-determined project chronogram and time table.

Many administrators and task managers overlook the fact that cases of current success have often built on years of preparation (tests and lessons learned) under related projects. One example was the World Bank-funded regional development projects in Burkina Faso's southwest where the "partial" participation model in the proposed cotton program increased the total income and living standards of a high percentage of the beneficiaries. Over time, this success enabled the settlers to invest time and money in the development of village infrastructure, which in turn raised the living standards even higher. This highly "successful" project built on a long period of "apprenticeship" under the Upper Volta Cotton Project (1970), the West Volta Agricultural Development Project (1977), and several decades of French-sponsored research and extension.

The tendency to underestimate the importance of apprenticeship can encourage planners to dismiss promising projects that do not produce measurable results within their first five years. One example was when the World Bank funding to develop craftsmen was not continued under the Second Urban Project.

Studies suggest that long period of participatory preplanning is probably the best means for shortening the time needed for apprenticeship. Care must be taken, however, that the preplanning takes the form of a dialogue in which the beneficiaries are able to express their views, knowing that the views will not be dismissed. This necessitates the presence of highly educated extension personnel, fluent in local dialects.

Recommendation: *Community participation is best conceived as a dynamic and long process. When project planners take time to associate the local populations, the result can be increased ownership. While more expensive in the short-run, this process can eliminate costly technical and social errors which increase project costs and implementation times.*

5. **Observation**: Despite their idealistic intentions, many so-called participatory projects are implemented as top-down orders and not based on expressed local needs.

This tendency was especially strong during the revolution when the CDR became a one-way conduit for the transmission of top-down "participatory" messages. More often than not, very little effort was made to discuss these messages with the local people or to ensure that the population's responses were transmitted back to the policy level. This frequently resulted in project designs or technological innovations that the beneficiaries either rejected (e.g. the First Urban Project's proposed payment schedule) or didn't understand (e.g. the Second Urban Project's first generation of road rehabilitation projects or the managerial requirements of the primary health posts). The *3 Luttes* (3 Battles) initiative to restrict unsupervised animals, bush fires, and illegal wood cutting was another example; the policy was announced as a revolutionary slogan with little attempt to involve local people in conceptualizing how the goals summarized in the slogan could actually be achieved.

Most village *groupements* were created in the same top-down method, with little input from the beneficiaries in defining their goals or administrative structure. Even the initial announcement of the "1 Village = 1 PSP" initiative was issued as an order, with no real thought as to what types of parallel training or investment would be needed to enable the Ministry to support the expanded system.

Recommendation: *The decision to launch a project involving community participation should not be issued as an order. The beneficiary population needs input into the project.*

6. **Observation**: Projects are often implemented in a top-down fashion because there are few local institutions to give expression to or to coordinate the action of the beneficiaries. This problem is often aggravated by the absence of legal texts or the non-application of the existing texts by the central administrative institutions.

A good example is Burkina Faso's weak urban governments. The rapid expansion of land allocation programs through the commando campaigns in the 1980s overloaded the capacity of the municipal governments to collect taxes and to mobilize populations for construction and maintenance of collective equipment like roads and canals. Efforts to address this issue were hampered by the ambiguous texts governing the urban municipalities. For example, the central Mayor of Ouagadougou is elected by the population at the same time that he or she represents the state as high commissioner, thus placing the mayor in a position of potential conflict.

Another example is the national policy that demanded the central management of funds recouped from regional and village level services. The principle of "unified" (centralized) accounting has been a major factor inhibiting the sustainability of district and village level health facilities. New laws permitting the decentralized management of health funds were only implemented in early 1994.

The inadaptation of the texts governing pre-cooperative *groupements* and cooperatives is another example. To date, the texts give almost no independent decision-making power to the local beneficiaries, thus making the rural population almost totally dependent on the CRPA for technical information, decision-making, and agricultural inputs. One result is that there are almost no horizontal mechanisms for internal or intergroup exchanges. The farmers thus find themselves isolated with few established channels for collective participation in natural resource management or the modernization of their production systems. Current efforts to introduce the modified T&V system through the World Bank-supported PRSAP and to get this system to collaborate with the PNGT are attempting to change this situation.

***Recommendation**: Participatory development approaches need to be supported by appropriate texts and strong, effective political will.*

7. **Observation**: Some administrative intervention is necessary to ensure that low-income groups participate in the elaboration, execution, and benefits of participatory projects.

Special donor intervention was necessary, for example, to prevent the benefits of the UNDP Habitat Project, the Dutch MAP, and the World Bank First Urban Project from being monopolized by more powerful high-income groups. Another example is the Third Urban Project's intervention to prevent the pilot project's sanitation work groups from being dominated by a powerful minority.

***Recommendation**: Without being too authoritarian, administrators must consciously exercise some degree of regulation to insure that a broad range of social and income groups profit from participatory interventions.*

8. **Observation**: Start-up funds are usually necessary to galvanize local participation.

While some communities have been able to independently fund development initiatives, such as the agriculture *groupements* that have undertaken health interventions, most communities need outside funding for project start-up. Examples include the contributions that UNICEF and various NGOs made to the "1 Village = 1 PSP" commando campaigns or the first World Bank-supported health project that equipped village pharmacies with their initial drug stocks.

The extremely successful Cissin Popular Development Bank benefitted from donor seed funding that was maintained and expanded by the local population. Other examples of "successful" initiatives that evolved from an initial start-up projects include the cereal banks and anti-erosion dikes created by farm groups trained by INADES.

When funds are not available, projects can fail. For example, the Young Farmer Training Centers (CFJA) were designed to increase the technological capacity of young farmers by training them in basic literacy and technical skills. Although the original project plan called for students to receive an initial fund for start-up equipment when they graduated, this support never materialized. The net result was that a high percentage of the graduates became frustrated, left the villages they were being trained to serve, and migrated to Burkina Faso's cities or to Côte d'Ivoire.

Recommendation: *Since local populations and the technical ministries involved in a development program don't usually have the financial resources to undertake collective development activities, foreign donors should not hesitate to provide resources for activities that the local populations have clearly identified as a priority.*

9. **Observation**: Development activities that were clearly identified by the community and that received adequate funding to get started were usually rapidly adopted. Successful adoption, however, creates a host of second generation problems for management and maintenance.

For example, the most successful borewell programs were those that were supervised by a well management committee and a specially trained technician. In cases where there was neither a committee nor a trained technician, the wells typically fell into disrepair.

Similarly, the mid-term evaluation of the Faso Baara project shows that many of its achievements are at risk of falling into disrepair if the municipal government does not elicit local participation to maintain them (Nachitigal, Thieba, and Badini 1993).

Recommendation: *Before creating community development projects, identify and include conditions needed for long-term management and maintenance.*

10. **Observation**: Basic literacy skills permit local populations to better understand technical training and to engage in "full" participation. In the absence of literacy skills, the beneficiary population is likely to remain passive.

Any attempt to improve the management of the new decentralized system of health services, for example, must be linked to efforts to improve basic literacy and accounting skills. Both the sector analysis and the recent World Bank-sponsored study of participation in the health sector emphasize that the high propensity for mismanagement and embezzlement of funds managed by the village health committees and village associations (*groupements*) was directly related to the low levels of education and training in these groups. Having ascertained the critical role of literacy in the "1 Village = 1 PSP" initiative, the Ministry of Health requested that the Ministry of Basic Education and Literacy (MEBAM) include community health agents in their literacy training programs. To date, there have been no studies to evaluate the impact of this literacy training on the management of the village-level primary health posts.[1]

Sanou's research on *groupements* in the Passoré Province showed that literacy training of the female *groupement* members improved their participation in *groupement* activities and permitted them to take more responsibility and control over the management activities of their elected leaders. Another study of village *groupements* in Burkina Faso's southwest showed that the most dynamic *groupements* were those in which there was a broad dispersion of literacy among the leaders and where there was some provision for periodically replacing the leaders.

The low literacy levels in the urban areas appear to be a major factor impeding the local peoples' ability to see the link between their personal habits (e.g. keeping livestock in the compound, dumping solid waste in drainage canals, gathering sand from the roads) and the steady degradation of their urban environment and living conditions.

***Recommendation**: Projects to promote development through community participation need to be linked to basic literacy programs to equip beneficiaries with the necessary skills to contribute to and benefit from collective activities.*

11. **Observation**: In the early stages of development, when state resources are weak and state development approaches tend to be "top-down," international and national non-governmental organizations can fill a vital gap between national and local institutions in promoting participatory development. To be sustainable, however, these NGO institutions must be backed by appropriate legislation, strong political will, and inter-agency coordinating bodies.

The case study illustrates that the flexible administrative structure and strong commitment of NGOs predisposes them to develop successful participatory approaches that are deeply rooted in the local cultures and goals of the beneficiary population. This success can be measured in terms of their ability to fund projects which respond to local needs, the low administrative costs of achieving these projects, and the relatively high sustainability of these investments over time.

In the case of Burkina, this NGO model became the model for a wider program of "self-help" development after 1983. The ability of Burkina Faso's NGOs to fulfill this role was critically linked to the strong support they received from the government through legislation and expressed political will.

The same history highlights the fact that this role is likely to evolve. The first large influx of international NGOs came for drought relief, but quickly shifted their attention to water resource and agricultural development. Over time, the same model was adapted by various national leaders and local organizations to develop national and local NGOs. Today Burkina's NGOs are increasingly focused on developing the non-farm income earning opportunities of strong local village associations or *groupements*.

A fourth institutional "lesson learned" is the critical need for governments to reinforce the development of inter-agency coordinating institutions to foster dialogue between NGOs and between NGOs and government.

Recommendation: *NGOs and sponsoring governments need to collaborate on the development of supportive legislation and appropriate interagency coordinating institutions.*

Recommendation: *National governments should support the participation of NGOs in the identification and execution of regional and national development plans.*

Recommendation: *In "scaling up" NGO programs to participate in national and regional development plans, NGOs must be alerted to the critical need to maintain their original focus on involving local communities in their own local development.*

Chapter Seven

Conclusion

This study of different development "projects", notably the projects realized with the aid of the World Bank, has led us to the following major conclusions.

1. The concept of community participation in development is not a new idea. It is a fundamental building block of all the traditional pre-colonial societies. In the non-hierarchic, "lineage" societies, which characterize Burkina Faso's south, the concept is the very basis of collective social identity (through the age grades) and individual advancement.

2. The innovative aspect of participation in Burkina Faso is the recent attempts by international organizations, including the World Bank, to specify the essential element of "true" community participation. Another innovative concept is the idea that the ultimate goal of "development" is to improve the living standards of the country and the beneficiary populations. By defining development as the improvement of a beneficiary population's living standards as both a precondition as well as a result of development projects, participation must now be voluntary and positive.

From this point of view, the concept of "true" participation must be participation that associates the beneficiaries at every stage of the project process, including conceptualization, execution, and maintenance, as well as decisions about how the benefits from a project should be distributed. A good example of this type of "true" participation is the current attempt by the World Bank-sponsored Third Urban Project to develop a new methodology for implicating community participation at every stage of developing urban sanitation services.

The worst type of participation is that which does not associate the population at any stage of the process except the physical execution of the development activities, as was the case during the forced labor campaigns of the colonial period.

3. Development has been conceived and understood by different people at different times in different ways. This has led to different methods and strategies that are sometimes in conflict with one another. This spatio-cultural-temporal dimension of the concept needs to be considered when examining the geographical, historical, and cultural particularities of a particular beneficiary population. This type of cultural sensitivity takes time. Planners need time to adapt and the local people need time to understand and respond (either positively or negatively). For this reason the typical means of organizing a project in a rigid, brief ("commando") time period is usually inefficient and frustrating for all involved, including foreign donors and the government.

4. For this reason it is critically important to anticipate a longer-than-average planning period. Even more likely to be successful will be projects in which this planning phase is combined with some sort of "operational research" or pilot project. Examples of Burkinabè initiatives that have used the pilot project concept include the National Program for Land Management (PNGT), the First Health Services Project, the Habitat, MAP, and Third Urban Project. The experience of the First Urban Project in expanding the Habitat pilot project model, however, demonstrates the critical importance of fully evaluating even the most "successful" pilot project before expanding it on a wider scale.

5. If one defines the ultimate goal of development as improved living conditions, the most promising, indeed the obligatory point of departure, is the expression and/or identification of the beneficiaries' needs. This demands a two-way system of communication: first the expression of those needs by the population and then the identification of needs by an external source like an NGO, donor, or government. The entire process is predicated on the existence of a supple, fluid mechanism for communication between all involved.

The regional development projects that were conceived and implemented after 1971 by the Burkinabè government with support from financial partners like the World Bank were the context for testing a new method of communicating agricultural extension messages. In general, however, the direction of these communication messages was from the technical services to the *groupements*. The efficacy of the *groupements* as development institutions could be improved by the creation of more effective channels for the populations to express their needs and preoccupations back to the technical services. This is a process that is being addressed through the World Bank-supported PRSAP.

The development of successful two-way communication processes can be enhanced by first studying the traditional channels of communication and then evaluating the adaptability of these channels to the task at hand. Some sort of external control, however, may be necessary to ensure that the communication process is not dominated by powerful social and economic groups. A good example of this type of external control is the role that donors played in ensuring that the needs of low-income groups were addressed in the Habitat, MAP, and First Urban Projects.

6. To be effective mobilizers and communicators, local institutions need to be perceived as "legitimate." The sector analyses show that local populations were generally not effectively mobilized by institutional structures imposed from outside and/or not recognized as "legitimate". There were instances in Burkina Faso's history where populations responded to unpopular policies only because the policies were communicated through legitimate channels. The prime example was the brute efficiency of the pre-World War II colonial government's "development" programs which were orchestrated through the Mossi chiefs. A series of bloody revolts and confrontations in 1915, 1916, 1917, and 1942 suggest that the non-hierarchical "lineage" societies in Burkina Faso's south were less willing to accept the colonial policies as having passed through a "legitimate" institutional structure.

In general, the CDRs were more successful in the rural areas where they operated under the aegis of the traditional (e.g. historically legitimate) power structure than in the urban areas where they did not. Another counter example is the ineffective record of the agricultural *groupements* or village health committees that were generally perceived as operating outside the legitimate power structure.

7. An important extrapolation of this study is the *absolute necessity* of implementing administrative and financial decentralization. Decentralization is essential to the creation of a strong base of appropriate local institutions.

The concept of fiscal and administrative participation--like that of "community participation"--is anything but new. What we wish to emphasize here, however, is not the concept per se but the problems created by its absence and the advantages associated with its presence.

Project documents associated with the First and Second Urban Projects emphasize the problems associated with the weak municipal structures for mobilizing the financial and human resources necessary for infrastructure management and satisfaction of the population's desire for improved living standards. The ultimate benefit of the Second Urban Project, outside of mobilizing financial resources (in terms of taxes and permit fees), is expected to be the creation of an institutional structure and mechanism for decentralizing political and economic power and mobilizing the permanent participation of citizens in improving their living conditions (e.g. development). The health sector analysis shows that decentralization is an essential precondition to the development of a sustainable system of village-level health facilities. In the same way the long-term success of the PNGT program is likely to hinge on the development of a decentralized system of finance and decision-making that can reinforce this multi-sectoral approach.

8. Given all that has been said, perhaps the most important lesson to be learned from an analysis of Burkina Faso's experience with participatory development is that development involves many elements and demands a global, multi-sectoral approach. Moreover, the ultimate goal of these approaches should always be to improve the living standards of the beneficiary populations. Only then can we anticipate that a development approach will elicit the full, enthusiastic participation of the beneficiaries. This type of global approach must necessarily involve all ministries and sectors.

Each development project must be conceived within a global context that is defined in terms of the national and local objectives, the appropriate institutions and mechanisms for attaining the objectives outlined for national development, and the appropriate rhythm for advancing as rapidly as possible toward these objectives. Special care must be taken, however, to calibrate the speed of this advance to a pace that does not alienate the beneficiaries as happened under Burkina Faso's forced march toward development at the height of the revolution.

In conclusion, the only true development is development that is participatory and in which participation is informed, voluntary, and beneficial to those who participate.

Is Burkina Faso's experience replicable? There's no way to know. Several elements of the Burkinabè history are unique. For example, over 50% of the population is from the same ethnic group, the Mossi, and the remaining 50% are groups that share many cultural similarities and/or have been in contact with the dominant ethnic group for centuries. Another Burkinabè advantage is the country has never been "blessed" with any high value commercial export like oil that would allow one socio-economic group to monopolize political and economic power. Whatever relatively distinct advantages and disadvantages Burkina Faso has enjoyed, the country's history provides us with a unique opportunity to examine one country's struggle to translate the concept of participation into real-world initiatives across a wide range of sectors.

Annex I

Methodology

The present study was designed to complement the program of research, training, and publications that the World Bank is engaged in as part of a one-year Bank-wide Learning Process on Popular Participation (Bhatnagar and Williams 1992). The purpose of the Learning Process is to find ways to strengthen the Bank's support for "popular participation" in ways that would further the Bank's development objectives. A core team drawn from throughout the Bank coordinates the learning process. Its basic design is based on developing and documenting a sample of 20 participatory Bank projects and programs. Six of the twenty are based in Africa region--the others are in Latin America, Asia, and Eastern Europe.

The Africa Region of the World Bank has a Thematic Team on Governance that cuts across the sectors and departments. A subset of that team forms the Subteam on Participation. The work program of the Subteam involves supporting the Bank-wide Learning Process, sharing of best practice within the region, and disseminating information to staff interested in expanding the participatory base for their development work. In 1992 the Subteam conducted a regional workshop in which substantial experience with participatory projects and programs was shared among staff. Following this workshop, the team concluded that the next step should be to study a country that had embraced participation as a key theme in development planning and implementation at the policy level. It was agreed, in consultation with the World Bank Country Team, that Burkina Faso would be the subject of the case study.

The case study research on which the present document is based was conducted in six stages.

Stage One: Preplanning

In November 1992, the study Steering Committee invited Della McMillan, an anthropologist from the University of Florida with extensive field experience in Burkina Faso, to coordinate the study in consultation with the Country Team and the Bank Resident Mission in Ouagadougou. Based on initial discussions, it was decided that the study should focus on four sectors (agriculture, natural resource management, health, and urban development). It should include interviews with a sample of beneficiaries and technicians associated with different World Bank-funded initiatives, as well as with administrators in the regional and central NGO and ministry offices. It was also decided that the research be conducted by a team of consultants who had held senior level government positions in the sectors that they were studying.

In December 1992, a revised TOR was submitted to the Steering Committee. In March 1993, the Head of the Burkina Faso Country Team (Whitney Foster) and Regional NGO Coordinator (Abdou S. Drabo) organized a series of one-on-one interviews with the members of the country team who were responsible for the proposed sectors. During these interviews, Ms. McMillan developed an initial history of World Bank projects in specific sectors and identified key documents. Based on these interviews, McMillan worked with Mr. Drabo, M. B. Bhatnagar (representing the Bank-wide Learning Process) and Mr. Foster to further revise the research plan. This research plan was circulated for comments to the Resident Mission, the Washington-based Burkina Country Team, the study Steering Committee, and the Core Team of the Bank-wide Learning Group on Popular Participation.

Stage Two: Development of the Research Plans for Each Sector

Ms. McMillan visited Burkina Faso in October 1994 to meet with the two consultants who had already been identified: Issa Kargougou, an agronomist and former head of FEER (Rural Water and Equipment Fund) who is currently attached to the Ministry of Agriculture, and Sylvestre Ouedraogo, a forester, former Minister of Environment and Tourism (MET) and former Permanent Secretary of the National Committee for the Fight against Desertification (CNCLD). Mr. Ouedraogo is currently the Program Coordinator for the United Nations Sudano-Sahelian Office (UNSO) at the United Nations Development Program (UNDP) office in Ouagadougou. UNDP graciously supported his participation in the study.

During the first ten days, this team interviewed members of the resident mission and heads of World Bank-sponsored projects to develop a detailed research methodology and to identify two additional consultants for the health and urban sectors. The additional consultants selected were Dr. Michel Sombié and Professor Fernand Sanou. Dr. Sombié, a medical doctor, is Director of Public Health and former Director of Research and Planning for the Ministry of Health. Mr. Sanou is a Professor of Sociology at the University of Ouagadougou who recently completed a massive research project on local participation in connection with the World Bank-supported Third Urban Project.

The team developed a general plan for the final report, a draft outline for interviews, and a provisional research plan for each of the sectors.

Mr. André Roch Compaoré, a geographer and former Minister of Rural Development, later joined to the team to assist with the final revision of the combined agriculture and natural resource management chapter and the final report. Mr. Drabo, the developed a separate paper analyzing the role of NGOs in fostering participatory approaches in Burkina Faso. Ms. McMillan served as the in-country coordinator, and was also responsible for preparing the draft synthesis report.

Stage Three: Research, Analysis and Preparation of the Draft Sector Analyses (November 1993)

Agriculture and Natural Resource Management. The research for agriculture and natural resource sector included a review of World Bank documents connected with sector projects, as well as a number of other relevant NGO and non-World Bank funded projects. In addition, the consultants (aided by two research assistants) conducted interviews with 14 top administrators attached to the central ministry, the current World Bank supported projects, and the Resident Mission, as well as with 28 administrators, technicians, and approximately 40 beneficiaries in three provinces (L. Nana 1993; S. Ouedraogo 1994; I. Kargougou 1993) (Table I.1). The three provinces that were chosen for more intensive interviews (Bougouriba, Gnagna, and Kouritenga) are provinces where the World Bank supports the activities of the National Land Management Program (PNGT). The Bougouriba Province was also the site of two large integrated regional development projects that had been supported by the World Bank (Bougouriba I and II). The beneficiaries who were interviewed belonged to village *groupements* or village land management committees that were identified by project staff; all interviews were conducted in group sessions. A separate analysis focusing on the legal and judicial context of participation was conducted for the agricultural sector (see Compaoré 1994).

Urban Development. The urban development sector analysis included a review of the literature on the First, Second, and Third Urban Projects, and Faso Baara as well as interviews with (Table I.1):

- 15 top administrators and technicians attached to the central administration, the municipal government, the World Bank-supported Second and Third Urban Projects, and the World Bank Resident Mission in Ouagadougou and Bobo-Dioulasso

- 90 beneficiaries (60 in Ouagadougou and 30 in Bobo-Dioulasso) and 9 beneficiary group leaders and traditional leaders in three neighborhoods which were affected by the World Bank-supported First Urban Project and Faso Baara: Cissin (Sector 16) in Ouagadougou; and Sonsoribougou (Sector 21) and Yégéré (Sector 10) in Bobo-Dioulasso. The beneficiary sample was chosen from the habitation "islands" created by the First Urban Project. The goal of the sampling technique was not to have a scientifically rigorous sample of the entire population, but to gain an understanding of the local people's perceptions about their participation in the different projects. The consultant was assisted by two research assistants.

In addition, the urban sector analysis benefitted from two related studies which were completed immediately prior to our research. These include:

- A detailed analysis of community participation in the Samandin neighborhood (Sector 7) of Ouagadougou at the site of the Third Urban Project's pilot project, including interviews with 400 households (700 persons) (MTPHU 1993)

- The mid-term evaluation of the Faso Baara project. The mid-term evaluation was based on a random stratified sample of participants (e.g. the businesses who received contracts from the project and the laborers who did the work) and beneficiaries (e.g. the urban governments and the individuals who use the infrastructure created by the project). The sample size included 51 businesses, 8 consulting firms, 8 engineering and architecture firms, and 10 laborers as well as interviews with the municipal administrators and a small sample of beneficiaries (stratified by age and sex) affected by 26 projects (39 sub-projects) (Nachitigal, Thieba, and Badini 1993).[1]

Health. The health sector analysis coincided with a detailed study of participation in the health sector (Table I.1). This study included 32 general background interviews with health officers and NGO staff in Bobo-Dioulasso, Houndé, Ouagadougou, Garango, and Tenkodogo, as well as 116 beneficiary interviews (22 in Bazega Province, 44 in Boulgou Province; and 50 in Houet Province) (see Ciardi, Poloni, Kinda, Ouedraogo and Ouedraogo 1993; Kinda and Ouedraogo 1993; J-B Ouedraogo 1993; B. Ouedraogo 1993).[2] Our own research focused on: 1) an analysis of the Ministry and World Bank documentation on the health sector in general and World Bank funded initiatives in particular, and 2) a more detailed analysis of the documentation of "successful" NGO and government-sponsored projects with which Dr. Sombie and his research assistant (Dr. Abdoulaye Traore) had been affiliated.

Stage Three: Research and Preparation of Sector Analyses

Based on the research, each consultant wrote a sector study that included:

- A historical analysis of the concept of participation in the sector and the World Bank-supported projects in that sector in terms of the :
  - Recognized (*de facto* and *de jure*) institutional mechanisms by which local participation was organized
  - Legal and political context of these institutions;
  - State and NGO structures charged with executing the different participatory approaches
  - Results of this participation in terms of the: 1) quality of life of the beneficiaries (especially the lowest income groups); 2) measurable, quantifiable results of government, donor, or beneficiary investment in a project or program; and 3) sustainability of the project results
- The micro- and macro-level institutional factors that contributed to or detracted from the achievement of positive project results

- A list of recommendations for the government and donors based on the research findings

Once completed, the first draft of each sector analysis was discussed with staff of the resident mission who was charged with assisting the consultants for each sector. A draft copy was also submitted to the international coordinator and Bank Task Manager for comments. Based on these comments, the first drafts of the agriculture, natural resource, and health analysis were revised (see Annex II for a complete list of sector reports and supporting documents).

Stage Four: Comparative Analysis and Preparation of Conclusions and Recommendations

After revision, the sector analyses were circulated to all members of the team. The team then organized a retreat on the outskirts of Ouagadougou to discuss the sector analyses and to prepare an outline for the chapters on "lessons learned" and recommendations. Based on this general outline, Mr. Sanou and Ms. McMillan prepared a draft chapter on "Lessons Learned," and Mr. Sanou, Ms. McMillan, and Mr. Compaoré prepared the draft "Conclusions." Following the group's recommendation, Mr. Sanou also wrote a separate analysis of the wider social and political context of participation in different time periods (see Annex II).

Stage Five: Discussion of the Draft Reports and Preparation of a Summary Report

A draft copy of the French version of the report (comprised of shortened versions of the three sector analyses, two introductory historical chapters, the lessons learned and conclusions chapters) was transmitted to the members of the Steering Committee, the Country Team, and the Regional Subteam on Participation. Mr. Ouedraogo accompanied Ms. McMillan to Washington, D.C. to discuss the report. Based on comments from the Country Team, Ms. McMillan and Mr. Ouedraogo revised the first two chapters, further revised the agriculture and natural resource management chapter, and developed a short summary of the sector analyses and an executive summary for the report. Ms. McMillan prepared the present version of the report, with strong support from Mr. Drabo.

Stage Six: Discussion and Revision of the Base Documents with the Steering Committee, the Country Team, the Resident Mission Staff and the National Government

The final stage will involve discussing the sector reports and this report with the Steering Committee, the Resident Mission staff, the Country Team, and the coordinators of the Bank-wide Learning Process. It is anticipated that the draft will be revised based on comments from the other members of the team and from reviewers. It is expected that the in-country team, working with the Resident Mission, will organize some sort of seminar or series of seminar to discuss the results with Government and with key informants in the different sectors.

Table I.1. Interviews conducted as part of the Burkina Faso case study of participation (See also Annex III)

Sector	World Bank & Other Donors	Top Administrators	Adm. of World Bank Projects	Regional Provinces/ Projects	Adm. Technicians	NGO	Beneficiaries	Trad. & Beneficiary Leaders
Nat. Res. Mgt. & Ag	5	7	2	Bougouriba	17	2	20	-
				Gnagna	7			
				Kouritenga	4	--	20	
Urban	2	5	3	Ouagadougou	--	--	60	8
				Bobo-Dioulasso	--	--	30	1(8)
Urban - 3rd Urban Project[2]							400 households (700 individuals)	
Urban Faso-Baara[3]				Random Sample Beneficiaries 26 Projects 39 Subprojects				
Health[4]	32			Bazega			22	
				Boulgou			44	
				Houet			50	

[1] Interview with chief was attended by 7 advisors. [2] Source: MTPHU 1983.
[3] Source: Nachitigal, Thieba, and Badini 1993. [4] Source: Ciardi et al, 1993

Annex II

List of Sector Reports and Analyses Prepared as Part of this Study

Agriculture and Natural Resource Management

Compaoré André Roch. Etude sur l'Evolution du Développement Participatif dans le Secteur Agricole. Janvier 1994 (43 pages)

Kargougou, Issa. Rapport introductif sur l'Evolution du Développement Participatif au Burkina Faso: Secteur Agricole. December 1993.

Nana Léopold. Elements de réponse aux 21 questions posées par la Banque Mondiale (Bank-wide Learning Process). (14 pages)

Nana Léopold. La gestion des ressources naturelles dans la province de la Bougouriba: Etude de cas. October 1993. (38 pages)

Ouedraogo Sylvestre Bangré. Etude sur l'évolution du développement participatif dans la gestion des ressources naturelles (GRN). January 1994.
(42 pages)

Ouedraogo Sylvestre Bangré et Compaoré André Roch. Etude sur l'évolution du développement participatif dans la gestion des ressources naturelles: Agriculture et Gestion des Ressources Naturelles. February 1994. (28 pages)

Urban & General History/Background

Sanou, Fernand. Etude sur le Développement Participatif au Burkina Faso. Secteur: Infrastructures Urbaines. February 1994. (97 pages).

Sanou, Fernand. Le Burkina Faso: géographie, histoire, et économie politique (11 pages).

Kibtonré, Gilbert. Aménagement urbain et développement participatif au Burkina Faso. November 1993. (10 pages)

Health

Sombie B. Michel and Traore Abdoulaye. Etude du Développement participatif dans le secteur de la santé au Burkina Faso. December 1993 (Revised version of November 1993 Report). (35 pages).

Sombie B. Michel and Traore Abdoulaye. Réponses aux 21 Questions Prioritaires (posed by the World Bank Bank-wide Learning Process on Participation) (8 pages).

NGOs (Non-governmental Organizations)

Drabo, Abdou Salam. Les ONG et la Participation Populaire au Burkina Faso. February 1992 (17 pages).

Annex III

List of People Interviewed

Urban Infrastructure
Ouagadougou

Government

Kibtonré Gilbert, Direction 3ème Projet Urbain, Directeur (a suivi tous les 3 projets urbains)
Belemsagha Denise, Direction 2ème projet Urbain, Directrice, ex-Sécrétaire Général, Mairie de Ouagadougou
Idani Seydou (Interview by McMillan, April 1, 1994), Agence Faso Baara, Directeur Général
Boly Mamadou, MTPHU-Direction Général de l'Urbanisme et de la Topographie (DGUT), ex-DGTPU
Kiemtoré Victor, MTPHU-DGUT, Directeur Général
Bagré Alain, MTPHU-Direction de l'Analyse et de la Statistique Urbaine Directeur Directeur
Durany-Jacob Jocelyne, 3ème Projet Urbain Projet-pilote, consultante et chef d'équipe du projet-pilote

Leaders, Beneficiaries in Areas Affected by Projects

Sawadogo Daouda, Caisse Populaire de Cissin, Directeur
Tiendrébéogo Michel, Haut-Commissariat du Kadiogo-Service de l'Habitat, Chef de service
Tiendrébéogo, Quartier Samandin (Secteur 7), Chef coutumier du quartier
Kafando, Quartier Cissin, Chef coutumier
Nikièma Amado, Secteur 7 (ancienne structure CDR), ex-délégué CDR, actuellement représentant administratif du secteur
Tiendrébéogo Amado, Secteur 7, représentant administratif du secteur
Kafando Bernard, Secteur 16 Cissin, Ex-délégué CDR représentant adminsitratif du secteur
Ouédraogo Daniel, Secteur 16 Cissin, représentant adminsitratif du secteur
Beneficiaries: 60 beneficiary interviews

World Bank

Bado Célestin, Banque Mondiale, Ouagadougou, Chargé des opérations
Diallo Korka, Banque Mondiale, Ouagadougou, Chargé de programme, responsable des projets urbains

Bobo-Dioulasso

Government

Traoré Amara, Haut-Commissariat, Haut-Commissaire et Maire Central de la ville
Zerbo Abdoulaye, Haut-Commissariat, Directeur Division
Paré Charles, Services Techniques Municipaux (STM), Directeur
Somé Bernard, STM, responsable service de l'habitat
Nouze Christophe, STM, Conseiller Technique 2ème Projet pour les problème d'ordures

Leaders and Beneficiaries in Areas Affected by Projects
Sanou Fabéré (entouré de 7 notables), Quartier Kolsama (ex-Sonsoribougou), Chef coutumier
Beneficiaries: 30

Agriculture and GRN
Ouagadougou

Government
Béatrice Damiba, Ancien Ministre de l'Environnement et du Tourisme (E.T.)
André Roch Compaoré, Ancien Ministre de l'Agriculture et de l'Elevage.
Albert Djigma, Ancien Ministre de l'Agriculture et de l'Elevage
Pierre Bandré, Ingénieur des Eaux et Forêt, Conseiller Technique du Ministre E.T.
Pallé Samidou, Directeur de l'Unité de Gestion Opérationnelle PNGT
Yameogo Denise, PNGT
Konaté Kaolo, Direction des Parcs Nationaux Faune et Chasse (M.E.T.)
Lankoandé Ibrahim, Direction de la Foresterie villageoise et de l'Aménagement des Forêts (M.E.T.)
Marcel Poussy, Sociologue

Development Agencies (Other)
Ousmane Tontorogbo, Correspondant National du CILSS
François Kaboré, Chargé de Programme PNUD

World Bank-Ouagadougou
Ibrahim Nébié, Banque Mondiale, Ouagadougou
Jeffrey Lewis, Banque Mondiale, Ouagadougou
Célestin Bado, Banque Mondiale, Ouagadougou

Bougouriba Province

Somé Florent, Coordinateur EMP-UGPO Diébougou
Barro Brahima, EMP-UGF Diébougou (Bougouriba)
Les producteurs du village de Tantiédougou-UP 10 Bougouriba (approx. 20)
Traore Adama, Directeur CRPA du Sud-Ouest
Somda Joseph, Anciens agent de la CIDR et du CRPA
Dabire Denis, Ancien agent de la CIDR et du CRPA
Traore Be Yaya, Chef de Service Formation et Vulgarisation CRPA/SO
Keita Tahirou, Agent du service Aménagement de l'espace rural, CRPA/SO
Mousa Sidibe, Contrôleur des Eaux et forêts (SPET-Diébougou)
Kam Sié Seydou, Service Provincial de l'organisation et de la Formation des producteurs
Some Jean Baptiste, Ancien chef de service provincial d'agriculture
l'Abbé Some Blaise, Coordination Diocésaine
Poda Fernand, Coordination Diocésaine
Some Florent, UPCO et UGF/PNGT, Diébougou
Barro Barima, UPGO et UGF/PNG, Diébougou
Traore Propser, Secrétaire Général de la Province de la Bougouriba

Dabire Odile, BPAF, CRPA/SO
Mme. Sankara, BPAF, CRPA/SO
Mme. Dissa, BPAF, CRPA/SO

Gnagna Province

Kaboré Bernard, Eaux et Forêts
Congo Issa, Elevage
Michel Thiombiano, Service Provincial Agriculture
Lamoudi Adelaïde Douamba, EMP Bogandé (Gnagna)
Tindano Marcel " " "
Dahani Noufou " " "
Naba Innocent " " "

Kouritenga Province

Traoré Irène, CRPA Koupela
Traoré Boureima, Elevage Koupela
Sawadogo Paul, Service Vulgarisation, Koupela
Ouattara Bernadette, EMP Koupela
Les producteurs du village de Gamboulsin (Kouritenga) (20)

Other

World Bank, Ouagadougou
Albert Osei, Resident Representative

UNDP, Ouagadougou
Ernest Nzekio, Resident Representative

African Development Bank (ADB), Côte d'Ivoire
Bonaventure Traore, Agriculture

Other Ouagadougou
Abdoulaye Barry, Directeur General, SIGNUR
Armelle Faure, Consultant, World Bank, Ouagadougou

World Bank, Washington
Bruce Benton, AF5PH
Bhuvan Bhatnagar, ENVSP
Chantal Dejou, AF5AG
Christian Diou, AF5IN
Anne Doizie, AF5CO
Paula Donnelly-Roark, AFTCB

John English, OED
Whitney Foster, AF5CO
Katherine Marshall, AF5
Josette Murphy, OED
Leslie Pean, AF5IN
Larry Salmen, ENVSP
Franz Schorosch, AF5AG
David Steeds, AGRMR; former Division Chief, AF5AG
Roger Sullivan, AFTHR
Bruna Vitagliano, AF5PH
Grace Yabrudy, AF5IN
Wendy Walker, Consultant, AF5CO
Peter Watson, AF5IN

Annex IV

References Cited in the Text

(See individual Sector Reports listed in Annex II for a complete list of references used in the study)

Agunbiade, S.A. 1976. Upper Volta: Background to Regional and Urban Development. Washington, D.C.: The World Bank, Development Economics Department, Urban and Regional Economics Division. Report No. URR-7601.

Ardjouma, Ouattara. 1993. Les enjeux de l'urbanisation à Ouagadougou. Eurêka, Révue Trimestriel du Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique et Technologique (CNRST) 0006: 24-25. Juillet.

AVV. 1985. Annex I: Textes fondamentaux relatif à la réorganisation foncière et agraire au Burkina Faso. Ouagadougou: AVV, Direction des Etudes, Programmes et du Controle (DEPC).

Balima, A. 1970. Genèse de la Haute-Volta. Ouagadougou: Presses Africaines.

Bhatnagar, Bhuvan and Aubrey C. Williams, eds. 1992. Participatory Development and the World Bank: Potential Directions for Change. World Bank Discussion Paper No. 183. Washington, D.C.: The World Bank.

Capron, J. 1973. Communautés villageoises Bwa Mali-Haute Volta, Tome 1, Fascicule 1. Paris: Institut d'Ethnologie.

Ciardi, P., A. Poloni, F. Kinda, B. Ouedraogo, and J-B Ouedraogo. 1993. Qualitative Survey of Utilization of Health Services, Participation and Health Needs in Burkina Faso's Rural Communities. January. Washington, D.C.: World Bank, AF5PHE.

Compaoré André Roch. 1994. Etude sur l'Evolution du Développement Participatif dans le Secteur Agricole. Janvier.

Drabo, Abdou Salam. 1992. Les ONG et la Participation Populaire au Burkina Faso. February.

Fage, J.D. 1964. Reflections on the Early History of the Mossi-Dagomba Group of States. In, The Historian in Tropical Africa. Eds., J. Vansina, R. Mauny, and L.V. Thomas. Pp. 177-191. London: Oxford University Press.

Faure, Armelle. 1992. Perception de l'approche gestion des terroirs par les populations rurales au Burkina Faso. Ouagadougou: Caisse centrale de cooperation economique. Ouagadougou: Ministère de l'Agriculture et de l'elevage. Secrétariat Général. Unité de Gestion Opérationelle du Programme National de Gestion des Terroirs.

ESMAP (Energy Sector Management Assistance Program). 1991. Burkina Faso: Urban Household Energy Strategy. Washington, D.C.: ESMAP Consultative Group, The World Bank.

FAO. 1978. Etude sur la contribution du secteur forestier à l'économie du Burkina Faso. Rome: FAO. Novembre.

Galland, B. and P. Vignal. 1989. Evaluation des Projets: BKF/83/CO4 and BKF/84/001. Amelioration des infrastructures sanitaires et de leur fonctionnement dans la region du centre-nord. Mars 1989.

Guyon, G. 1986. Rapport d'évaluation de la phase préparatoire d'un programme de gestion des terroirs villageois. Ouagadougou: Caisse centrale de coopération économique. Décembre.

Hammond, P. 1966. Yatenga: Technology in the Culture of a West African Kingdom. New York: The Free Press.

Hervouet, J.P. 1978. La mise en valeur des vallées des Volta blanche et roughe: un accident historique. Cahiers ORSTOM: Série sciences humaines XV, I:81-87.

Hervouet, J.P., F. Clanet, F. Paris, et H. Some. 1984. Settlement of the Valleys Protected from Onchocerciasis after Ten Years of Vector Control in Burkina. OCP/GVA/84.5. Ouagadougou: OCP.

Jaglin, Sylvy. 1991. Pouvoirs urbain et gestion partagée à Ouagaodugou. Equipements et services de proximité dans les périphéries. Tome I, Thèse de doctorat de l'Université de Paris VIII en Urbanisme et Aménagement. Paris.

Kargougou, Issa. 1993. Rapport introductif sur l'Evolution du Développement Participatif au Burkina Faso: Secteur Agricole. December.

Kibtonré, Gilbert. 1981. Projet Habitat: une étude d'évaluation exhuastive du projet 5 ans après sa réalisation. Ouagadougou: PNUD.

Kibtonré, Gilbert. 1993. Aménagements urbain et développement participatif au Burkina Faso. November.

F. Kinda and J-B. Ouedraogo. 1992. Santé, Participation, et Structures sociales. Aout.

McMillan, D., J-B Nana, and K. Savadogo. 1993. Settlement and Development in the River Blindness Control Zone. Case Study: Burkina Faso. World Bank Technical Paper No. 200. Series on River Blindness Control in West Africa. Washington, D.C.: The World Bank.

MAE (Ministère de l'agriculture et de l'elevage). 1992. Projet de renforcement des services d'appui aux producteurs (PRSAP). Revue a mi-parcours. Rapport du groupe vulgarisation. Ouagadougou. Avril.

MET (Ministère de l'environnement et du Tourisme). 1988. Rapport de l'Atelier Post-Evaluation des projets bois de villages, financement Suisse et Néerlandais et Bois collectifs et familiaux financement Suédois. Koudougou du 06 à 09 Décembre 1988. Mars.

MSAS (Ministère de la santé et de l'action sociale). 1988. Opération un village un PSP. Rapport de la cellule de suivi des postes de santé primaire, 1986-1987. Ouagadougou: MSAS, Cellule de Suivi des PSP.

MSAF (Ministère de la santé, de l'action sociale et de la famille). 1992. Document de Projet: "Appui aux soins de santé primaires dans la province de la sissili pour la period 1993-1996." Leo, BF: MSAF, Direction Provinciale MSAF de la Sissili.

MTPHU. 1993. Participation communautaire-Enquête -Concessions. Rapport provisoire. Ouagadougou: MTPHU, Direction du 3è Projet de Développement Urbain. September.

Nachitigal, Jacquie, D. Thieba, Z. Badini. 1993. Revue a Mis-parcours du Projet TIPE. Evaluation Socio-Economique. Rapport Definitif. October.

Nana, Leopold. 1993. La Gestion des Ressources Naturelles dans la Province de la Bougouriba: Etude de Cas. October.

Nigg, Wolfram. 1993. Sélection d'un quartier pour l'operation pilote. Etude du milieu. Juin.

Ouedraogo, B. 1993. Ce que "la medecine traditionnelle" veut dire.

Ouedraogo, J-B. 1994. Systèmes de santé et changement social dans le Boulgou: configurations et participations.

Ouedraogo Sylvestre Bangré. 1994. Etude sur l'évolution du développement participatif dans la gestion des ressources naturelles (GRN). January.

Ouedraogo Sylvestre Bangré et Compaoré André Roc. 1994. Etude sur l'évolution du développement participatif dans la gestion des ressources naturelles: Agriculture et Gestion des Ressources Naturelles. February.

PDA-BM (Projet de Développement Agricole de la Boucle du Mouhoun [ex-Volta-Noire]). 1989. Rapport d'achevement de Projet. Projet de développement agricole de la Boucle du Mouhoun. Crédit 1284 UV). Dedougou, B.F.: MAE, CRPA Boucle Mouhoun.

PDA-HB (Projet de Développement agricole des Hauts-Bassins). 1989. Rapport d'achevement du PDA-HB. Juillet. Bobo-Dioulasso: MAE, CRPA des Hauts-Bassins.

Sanou, Fernand. 1994. Etude sur le Développement Participatif au Burkina Faso. Secteur: Infrastructures Urbaines. February.

Savadogo, Kimseyinga and Claude Wetta. 1991. The Impact of Self-Imposed Adjustment: The Case of Burkina Faso, 1983-1989. Innocenti Occasional Papers, No. 15. Special Subseries: Structural Adjustment in Sub-Saharan Africa. April.

Savadogo, K., J. Sanders, and D. McMillan. 1989. Farm and Female Income and Productivities in the River Blindness Settlement Zone of Burkina Faso. Land Settlement Review Draft Site Report. Binghamton, NY: IDA.

SEPIA (Société d'Etudes de Projets d'Investissement en Afrique). 1990. Etude Demographique. Projections de la population Burkinabè pour les années 1990, 1995 et 2000. Ouagadougou: SEPIA.

Skinner, E.P. 1964. The Mossi of Upper Volta: The Political Development of a Sudanese People. Stanford, California: Stanford University Press.

Skinner, Elliott. 1974. African Urban Life: The Transformation of Ouagadougou. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Sombié, M. 1990. Burkina Faso: Building on the Successes. In, Achieving Health for All by the Year 2000: Midway Reports of Country Experiences. Eds, E. Tarimo and A. Creese. Pp.5-29. Geneva: World Health Organization.

Sombié B. Michel and Traoré Abdoulaye. 1993. Etude du Développement participatif dans le secteur de la santé au Burkina Faso. December. (Revised version of November 1993 Report)

Sondo, B., A. Traore, M. Sangare, C. Youl. 1993. La participation communautaire dans l'organisation des soins de santé préventifs dans la province du Houet (Burkina-Faso). Santé Publique 1: 23-27.

Soubeiga, Kamba André. 1992. Les strategies des soins de santé primaires au Burkina. Mobilisation communautaire et logiques paysannes. L'exemple de la Sissili. Thèse pour le doctorat de sociologie nouveau régime. Université de Bordeaux II. UFR des Sciences Sociales et Psychologiques. Section de Sociologie.

Soubeiga, Kamba André. 1994. Etude de la participation communautaire dans la mise en oeuvre des SSP (cas de la Sissili).

Watson Peter. 7 Feb 1994. Response to Minister of Employment regarding the Mid-term Review of the Project.

World Bank, AF5AG. n.d. The Training and Visit System in Burkina Faso: An Initial Assessment. Washington, D.C.: The World Bank.

World Bank. 1989. Burkina Faso: Economic Memorandum. Washington D.C.: World Bank, Africa Regional Office, Sahelian Department. Report No. 7594-BUR.

World Bank. 1990. Economic Issues in Renewable Natural Resource Management. Report No. 8762-BUR. Washington, D.C.: World Bank, Agriculture Operations, Sahelian Department, Africa Region.

World Bank, AF5AG. 1991. Staff Appraisal Report. Burkina Faso. Environmental Management Project. March 12, 1991. Report No. 9094-BUR. Washington, D.C.: World Bank, Africa Region, Division of Agriculture.

World Bank, AF5AG. 1993. National Environment Management Project (Cr. 2229-BUR). Full Supervision Report. Washington, D.C.: World Bank, AF5AG.

World Bank, AF5IN. 1978. Report and Recommendation of the President of the International Development Association to the Executive Directors on a Proposed Credit to the Republic of Upper Volta for an Urban Development Project. January 17, 1978. Report No. P-2204-UV. Washington, D.C.: The World Bank.

World Bank, AF5IN. 1978. Appraisal of Upper Volta Urban Development Project. January 3, 1978. Washington, D.C.: The World Bank, Urban Projects Department. Report No. 1660a-UV.

World Bank, AF5IN. 1987. Project Completion Report. Burkina Faso. Urban Development Project (Credit 766-BUR). December 1, 1987. Washington, D.C.: The World Bank, Western Africa Region, Urban Projects Department.

World Bank, AF5IN. 1989. Staff Appraisal Report. Burkina Faso. Second Urban Project. September 12, 1989. Washington, D.C.: World Bank, Infrastructure Operations Division. Report No. 8033-BUR.

World Bank, AF5IN. 1991. Staff Appraisal Report: Burkina Faso Public Works and Employment Project, May 31, 1991. Infrastructure Operations Division, Africa Region. Report No. 9535-BUR.

World Bank, AF5PH. 1985. Burkina Health Services Development Project. Staff Appraisal Report. Report No. 5352-BUR. May 20, 1985.

World Bank, AF5PH. 1991. Burkina Faso-Health Services Development Project. Supervision Report.

World Bank, AF5PH. 1993. Pre-appraisal Review Meeting. Burkina Faso-Proposed Health and Nutrition Development Project (PDSN).

World Bank. 1993. World Development Report, 1993: Investing in Health. Washington.

Zahan, D. 1967. The Mossi Kingdoms. In, West African Kingdoms in the Nineteenth Century. Eds., D. Forde and P. Kaberry, Pp. 152-178. London: Oxford University Press.

Notes

Chapter Two

1. Hammond (1966:110-111) describes this:

> The economic ties that unite all members of the sib [the boodoo] are activated most rigorously and continuously within its component lineages. First here is the fact of collective ownership of land by all agnates, the spirits of their ancestors, and the future generations of their descendants. Only through membership in the sib [the boodoo] can the Mossi acquire the right to land use, and only through proper land use can they retain this right. This requires adherence to traditionally sanctioned patterns of land tenured--those established by the ancestors, assured by training, and reinforced by the elders.

2. The organization imitated the social hierarchy of the surrounding society in that the young people often take the names of influential chiefs in the zone. In addition, each member of the group was responsible for one group activity. For example the *sornaba* (road chief) would be the individual who would coordinate the group's travel between work activities; the *kombinaba* (the youth chief) would be the individual in charge of supervising the youngest members of the group.

3. These institutions include the *Caisse National de Depots et d'Investissements* to help Voltaic entrepreneurs save and have access to credit; the creation of the *Office de la Promotion de l'Emploi Voltaic* in 1974 to help entrepreneurs organize businesses as well as the creation of a large number of semi-autonomous parastatal "offices" and commercial, and industrial enterprises who were granted a certain amount of financial autonomy.

4. The regime of Colonel Saye Zerbo, which took power in 1980, was characterized by a return to the earlier model of mobilizing "human resources" as opposed to the "economic" mobilization efforts that characterized the Lamizana era. These reforms included doing away with many of the special prerogatives of the elite class that Lamizana's "Voltaïsation" policies had unintentionally created. In general, however, the labor unions deemed that the economic benefits that accrued from the reforms were insufficient. What followed was another series of strikes.

5. The principal goals of the PPD were to:

- Illustrate the capacity of Burkina Faso to realize economic and social development by mobilizing its internal resources, with little or no aid from outside donors (summarized in the popular revolutionary slogan: "compter d'abord sur ses propres forces" [translation: first count on your own strengths])

- Prove, in the Burkinabè context, that the coordinated effort of the masses could be the determinant factor in bringing about social development

- Continue to inspire and improve the political consciousness and spirit of the working masses (*Ministère de la Planification et du Développement Populaire, Programme Populaire de Développement*, October 1984-December 1985)

Chapter Three

1. The goal of the CFJA program was to encourage the participation of young farmers in rural development. the CFJA targeted the recruitment of young farmers who were unable to attend the country's scant network of elementary schools. The goal was to provide these young farmers with basic literacy skills (first in French then later in national languages) through a curriculum that emphasized the promotion of "progressive" extension themes. The same program aspired to provide the young farmers with a small fund to purchase improved equipment when they left the program.

2. Two of the central tenets of the RAF involve the nationalization of all land rights and the appropriation of usufructuary rights to whoever clears the land. Access to urban and urban land was to be given to "those who show a real need, without distinction of sex or matrimonial status" (AVV 1985:18; translation).

A third theme focuses on the need to invest local residents and village leaders with responsibility for the management of land resources. In theory the local revolutionary committees were given the power to acquire land--overriding the power of the traditional chiefs or *tengasobas* (earth priests).

A fourth theme dealt with regional land use planning. Chapter 2, Article 21 states that rural land management must consider the integration of all the activities of rural live--agriculture, livestock, and forestry--taking into account the natural potential of an area. The need for each development plan to designate land for pastoralist was also emphasized (Chapter 3, Article 24).

3. In theory, the national program for village land management (PNGT) has been mainstreamed the same way the new T&V (training and visit) extension methodology has been mainstreamed through the national extension service. In practice, the approach exists in most provinces but is still largely confined to specific donor supported"projects" --much as the concept of T&V was confined to a few donor supported projects during the late 1970s. What one finds then, within a single province, is a series of approaches having a village land management approach but slightly different methods for achieving this approach. In the Bourgouriba, for example, the World Bank supported program focuses on the use of multidisciplinary mobile teams to work with the village land management committees, state structures, and regional coordinating bodies (*cadre de concertation*).

In the same province, the German supported UP10 is attempting to carry out the same sort of village program by channeling funds through a project structure which parallels the extension service. In the World Bank project, the mobile multidisciplinary teams are expected to work with the existing technical services to activate the funds for implementing the projects outlined in the village contracts. In contrast, the German funded UP10 project has special funds with which to realize village development investments.

4. Four criticisms that were raised by respondents at all of the study sites included: 1) the need for more effective coordinating bodies (*cadre de concertation*) to link the different ministries and NGOs that support the approach; 2) the need for more effective collaboration of the "participatory" development models being proffered by the agricultural extension staff and the members of the PNGT program's interdisciplinary mobile teams; 3) the need for more effective decentralization of decision-making and finance to the provincial ministry offices so that they can better respond to the needs identified by the villages; and, given the short-term absence of this type of de facto decentralization, 4) the need for more project funds to support complementary development investments in the target villages.

Chapter Four

1. The declaration, which was adopted by all the African countries under the guidance of the World Health Organization and UNICEF, issued a formal statement of the absolute need for community participation in the health development. The declaration defined the goal of primary health services as "the provision of basic health services, made universally accessible to all the individuals and families of a community with their full participation." Burkina Faso officially adopted the Alma-Ata primary health strategy the 14 of March 1979 with the adoption of their Ten-Year Health Strategy (*Programmation Sanitaire Nationale*, 1980-1990).

2. The goal was to construct one PSP in each village. In addition, each community was expected to contribute at least 5000 CFA for basic drugs and equipment, to construction a building to house the PSP, and to contribute to the support of the health agents during their training. The government in turn agreed to provide a small stock of basic drugs and equipment, a wheel barrow (to assist with construction), a bicycle for the village health workers, and gasoline for transportation of patients to the regional centers.

3. More specifically the decree authorized the: "retention and utilization of the receipts" generated by the health services, the sale of generic essential drugs, and the sale of other health products. Article 1 of the 1993 *arrêt* outlined the creation of a management committee in each heath center. Article 3 outlined the responsibilities of that committee as management of health funds, mobilization of community participation, and elaboration and execution of the center's health budget.

Chapter Five

1. Jaglin (1991: 62) notes that the traditional system where individuals would present small symbolic gifts like a rooster, kola nuts, or sugar to the individual who granted them infrastructure rights evolved very quickly into a system of cash payments for the "traditional" land rights. By 1970 the price had escalated to between 26,000 and 100,000 CFA for a parcel that measured between 250 m^2 and 450 m^2 in 40% of the recorded cases.

2. In 1978, only four of the 58 permanent water fountains in Ouagadougou were located in the non-registered, spontaneously settled neighborhoods (World Bank, AF5IN 1978b:3). With almost no access to public wells, the inhabitants of the peripheral zones were forced to purchase water from mobile water carriers who resold the water for five times what they paid. During the rainy season the average household purchased 7-10 liters of water per person and relied on water from shallow, polluted wells for the remainder of their needs; during the dry season, the average household purchased as much as 15-20 liters of water per person per day (World Bank, AF5IN 1978b:3)

3. The beneficiaries we interviewed expressed their satisfaction with the original model for participation. They noted that the mechanism enabled all residents, including renters, to have a voice in the project conception. One of the outputs of this participation was a lengthy and expensive renegotiation of the project development technology to a more "classic" regular, orthogonal layout with wide boulevards which would require substantial demolition" (World Bank 1987, AF5IN: 8). The same institutional channels enabled the indigenous inhabitants to negotiate a much lower plot price than higher income beneficiaries coming from the outside (who usually had higher incomes) (15,000 CFA vs. 3,750) (World Bank, AF5IN 1987:17).

The beneficiaries stated that the quality of local participation in the initial planning stages went down once the CDR came into power. The most frequent accusation was that the CDRs deliberately ignored certain persons for political reasons. When the former CDR chiefs were interviewed, they responded that many of the "ignored" residents were really non-resident speculators.

4. In 1978 responsibility for urban development in Upper Volta was jointly shared by several ministries, including the Ministry of Public Works, Transport, and Town Planning which was responsible for the execution of urban projects, the Ministry of Rural Development, whose Rural Development works Department supervised rural and urban water supply, and the Ministry of Interior which supervised all municipal activities. The Ministry of Public Works, through its Department of Town Planning, proposed urban development policies and projects for all urban areas which were reviewed by the National Town Planning Council before submission for approval by the Council of Ministers. The Minister of the Interior supervised the activities of the municipalities but day to day management of municipal affairs was left to the mayors and their staff (World Bank, AF5IN 1978b:8).

5. Project planning to develop the estimated costs and conditions for participation were based on income estimates developed as part of the Habitat Project and the World Bank-supported studies. The project planners estimated the average family revenues (for 8 persons) at 16,500 CFA/month. Based on this calculation, they estimated that even the poorest families, those with a monthly income of less than 10,000 CFA per month would be capable of making the monthly payment for the parcel as well as a payment on a small construction loan.

A crisis arose at the moment that the project was ready to distribute the parcels. By this time, a series of unpredicted price increases had tripled the financial costs of the land allocation process so that the average cost increased from 160 CFA/m^2 to 579 CFA/m^2, bringing the average cost for a mid-sized parcel (300 CFA/m^2) to 210,000 CFA, payable over five years. This dramatic increase provoked the beneficiaries to protest and suspend all payments except the original 25,000 CFA down payment. Follow-up negotiations between the beneficiaries, the government, and the World Bank enabled the project to revise the costs from 579 CFA/m^2 to 467-550 CFA/m^2. Even this was considered excessive when compared with the costs that other projects charged for comparably sized plots and levels of development (less than 100 CFA/m^2 for the Habitat Project and 300 CFA/m^2 for the MAP).

6. In Ouagadougou, rates decreased from 1862 CFA [$5.90] in 1980 to 982 CFA [$3.10] in 1985 and 982 CFA [$5.70] in 1987; Bobo-Dioulasso was characterized by an even steeper decline from 1880 CFA [$5.90] to 932 CFA [$2.90) in 1987).

7. Current efforts by the Second Urban Project to identify the city streets with fixed name plates (70 out of 1,500 have already been named in Ouagadougou) will make it easier for the tax services, Water, ad electric departments to deliver services and insist on payment. The same system for identification will make it easier for the municipalities to demand that neighborhoods contribute to group the area development or maintenance through collective work or fines.

The Project's support for waste management has focused on improving the stock of basic equipment such as garbage trucks and garbage bins (115 for Ouagadougou and 113 for Bobo-Dioulasso). The municipal representatives (the *haut commissaire* and the *conseilleur aux services techniques municipaux*) justify this approach with the argument that local beneficiaries must witness these concrete activities before they are willing to support them and other urban services.

The Project's road rehabilitation projects have been similarly top-down. Nevertheless, the local impact of these projects was generally positively received. The chief concern that emerged from interviews with municipal administrators (the *Maire Centrale*, the *Division Technique des Services Techniques Municipaux*, the *Conseiller des Services Techniques Municipaux pour la Collecte des Ordures*) was the lack of any "real" participation of the local population in the conception of the road projects. They argued that this lack of participation had created a few situations in which the population did not understand what types of behavior changes would be needed to realize the full benefits of a new development. The same lack of

participation decreased the chances that the local populations would support long-term maintenance.

8. One example of this was the creation of rain water canals in the Colma and Yéguéré neighborhoods of Bobo-Dioulasso. The residents were long accustomed to periodic flooding and had made individual adjustments. With the advent of the new drainage ditches, the water was redirected into the street, creating a new breeding area for mosquitoes.

9. Cost recovery in the First Urban Project started off well. At the end of 1984, beneficiaries in arrears totaled 18% (World Bank 1987, AF5IN: 18). By December 1993, however, one fourth (740) of the 2,900 stake holders still owe a sum equivalent to one-third of the total amount due 4.5 years after the last payment deadline (15 July 1989). The vast majority of these individuals are classified as "original residents", whose marginal economic situation made it difficult for the government to justify foreclosure. In Ouagadougou, less than one-fifth (20.9%) of the 7,270 beneficiaries are actually up to date with their parcel payments.

Most participants in the MAP project complained that they could ill afford the full 45,000 payment. As a result, only 30% repaid their loans (8% at Gounghin, 24% at Nossin, 21% at Sud, and 21% at Tampouy as of 1987) (Jaglin 1991). However, Jaglin argues that even with the smaller collections, 70% of the costs were recovered since the actual unit cost of the operation was less than 20,000 CFA (Jaglin 1991).

Chapter Six

1. Nevertheless, the office of the Ministry of Health that is charged with public information, education, and relations continues to work with the *Institut National d'Alphabétisation* to produce written documents on health in national languages.

Annex I

1. This mid-term review included interviews with (Nachitigal, Thieba, and Badini 1993):

- A random sample of 30% of the 146 businesses and research offices (n=51 businesses and 8 research offices) that had been awarded at least one Faso Baara contract as of April 30, 1993 (Annex 1)

- A random sample of 30% of the 26 (n=8) engineering, architectural, and mixed engineering-architecture firms (maître d'oeuvre) that had Faso Baara contracts (Annex 2)

- A random sample of 10 laborers who were working for the construction companies who held Faso Baara contracts (Annex 3)

- A series of intensive, open ended interviews with the beneficiaries of 25% of the 146 Faso Baara projects that had been completed (n=26 projects or 39 sub-projects). The projects to be studied were randomly chosen from a list of completed projects stratified by project type. The "beneficiaries" were defined at two levels: (a) the urban governments (commune, High commissioner, quartier); and (b) the individuals (male, female, youth, and merchants) who used the project-created infrastructure (schools, dispensaries, etc.) (Annex 4).

2. The research methodology for the World Bank-sponsored study relied primarily on individual semi-structured and open-ended interviews (most of which were taped) supplemented by direct observation in the health centers located in the field-work areas (Ciardi et al. 1993:1). Semi-structured interviews utilizing a detailed interview-guide were conducted with male and female villages and with the personnel of the district Health and Social Promotion Centers (CSPS). The researchers also conducted open-ended interviews with key-informants such as traditional healers, "wise men", and village heads. Other interviews were conducted with the administrators and staff to eh Ministry of health as well as with representatives of NGOs, development agencies/organizations and international donors. The study also benefitted from collaboration with the French Institute for Development Research (ORSTOM). The interviews were conducted in two areas of the Houet Province and two areas in the Boulgou province; a test survey was conducted in the Bazega Province.