



Contents lists available at ScienceDirect

Cities

journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/cities

Gated communities and city marketing: Recent trends in Guaynabo, Puerto Rico

Carlos A. Suárez Carrasquillo

Adjunct Assistant Professor of Politics, School of Critical Social Inquiry, Hampshire College, 893 West Street, Amherst, MA 01003, USA

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:

Received 31 August 2010

Received in revised form 14 March 2011

Accepted 28 May 2011

Available online 6 July 2011

Keywords:

Gated communities

City marketing

Guaynabo

Puerto Rico

ABSTRACT

Surprisingly little work has examined the role of city marketing in the development and promotion of gated communities. Here, I examine how the municipal government of Guaynabo, Puerto Rico reshaped the town's spaces, facilitating the emergence of gated communities beginning in the 1980s and continuing today. I argue that, during the last decades, city marketing has been used as a tool by the municipality to attract people who are of a higher socioeconomic class. Here, it is suggested that city marketing is an important factor to consider when analyzing the emergence and proliferation of gated communities. Moreover, the gated communities literature will benefit from examining the role of municipalities in seeking an explanation for this growing urban reality.

© 2011 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

Introduction

During the late 1980s and early 1990s, gated communities began to proliferate. In Puerto Rico, gated communities have increased since the enactment of Law 21 in 1987, which allows for the legal gating of existing neighborhoods in the country. However, despite the increase in gating, little attention has been paid to understanding how gated communities influence the lives of Puerto Ricans or how the Puerto Rican experience fits within the gated community literature. Unlike other regions, Puerto Rico has developed a robust culture of gating that has been influenced by Puerto Rico's colonial status. Here, I argue that in Guaynabo, Puerto Rico, gated community developers and the municipality have worked together to develop a city marketing campaign that prominently features the use of the English language and aims to Americanize the city.

The following article will review and challenge current explanations and characteristics of gated communities. To support these challenges, I will present the case of Guaynabo and describe how city marketing has been a driving force behind the recent development of gated communities in Puerto Rico. I propose that the municipal government is an active facilitator of gated communities through its collaborative efforts with developers and by making use of a city marketing campaign. The role of city marketing as a promoter of gated communities is proposed as a contribution to the gated community literature.

A brief history of Guaynabo and Puerto Rico

Puerto Rico is an island located at the eastern end of the Caribbean, the smallest of the Greater Antilles. The Spanish arrived in Puerto Rico on November 19, 1493, and the first colonial settlement was Caparra (located in present day Guaynabo), which was established in 1508. With the support of the Spanish Crown, Caparra was deserted for a new settlement in 1521; today's Old San Juan (Rodríguez Villanueva, 1984). Guaynabo was established as a permanent town in 1768 and, because of its proximity to the capital city, it assisted the emerging city of San Juan with food and goods (Rodríguez Villanueva, 1987). Monte Edén (Mount Eden) in Guaynabo provided a contrast, desired by many residents of San Juan who looked to escape the urban confinement by retreating to Guaynabo's countryside during the 19th century (Quiles Rodríguez, 2003). In 1898, Puerto Rico was no longer under Spanish control as a result of the Spanish-Cuban-American War. During a naval invasion that started in Guánica, Puerto Rico became the American territory it is today.

The twentieth century was a period of great urban change in Puerto Rico. By the mid 20th century, in order to meet the needs of Puerto Rico's growing middle class, urban sprawl emerged as a result of the construction of *urbanizaciones* (subdivisions) and *residenciales públicos* (public housing) (Safa, 1974). The dominant urban design, featuring a town square with a church and a city hall that existed during the Spanish colonial period, was abandoned for a decentralized urban model similar to what is seen in the United States. During this time of industrialization, Guaynabo saw a significant emergence of *urbanizaciones* as a result of its proximity to San Juan. Suchville, a gated community established in the 1930s in Guaynabo, is thought to be the first gated community in Puerto Rico (Rodríguez Juliá, 2008).

E-mail address: profesorsuarezcarrasquillo@yahoo.com

Puerto Rico's Spanish, and now American, colonial history provides an important context for understanding how language has impacted the development of cities across the island. English (the language of the second and current colonial power) started to appear in everyday life in the late 19th and early 20th centuries through a process of Americanization led by the invading forces. However, Spanish remains the predominant language used in everyday affairs. Although there are examples of Americanization throughout Puerto Rico's history, Guaynabo's city marketing campaign is a more recent example of an attempt to Americanize the city.

Gated communities globally and in Guaynabo

Around the world, gated communities have emerged for a variety of reasons. Researchers investigating gated communities have used several approaches and identified a number of reasons for gating. Categories of gated communities have been developed and include: (1) lifestyle communities, (2) prestige communities, and (3) security zone communities (Blakely & Snyder, 1997). Lifestyle communities are typically located in suburban areas and cater to those seeking a particular lifestyle (e.g., golf communities). Prestige communities, on the other hand, lack the recreational amenities of the lifestyle community, but are distinguished from other residential areas because they feature gates for protection. Security-zone communities occur in strictly urban contexts and arise in response to the fear of crime. In security-zone communities, gates were usually not envisioned as part of the original design. Of these categories of gated communities, prestige and security-zone communities are the most common in Guaynabo.

Other investigations related to the recent surge in gated communities globally have examined: homogeneity within gated communities (Low, 2003), how economic globalization and local institutional changes influence the rise of foreign gated communities (Wu & Webber, 2004), crime rates within these communities (Wilson-Doenges, 2000), how fear of crime leads people to gate up (Caldeira, 2001; Coy & Pöhler, 2002), the stability of property values within gated communities (LaCour-Little & Malpezzi, 2001), how local governments contribute to the existence of these communities (McKenzie, 2003; Thuillier, 2003), the importance of categorizing the physical forms (i.e. the type of gate or barrier) of gated communities (Grant & Mittelsteadt, 2004), the social sustainability of gated communities (Bagaeen & Uduku, 2010), and how some gated communities are club realms (Webster, 2001, 2002; Glasze, 2005). The vast majority of the literature examining gated communities has focused on exploring the mechanisms of enclosure and the reasons individuals choose to live in gated communities. Little work, to date, has investigated the role that municipal city marketing can play in promoting gated communities.

Similar to what Low (2003) found within gated communities in the United States, new gated communities within Guaynabo appear to cater to a homogenous class of people seeking prestige and a sense of security. Previous work has examined how some gated communities are club realms, allowing residents to enjoy amenities and services exclusive to their community (Webster, 2001, 2002; Glasze, 2005). The amenities in the prestige communities are minimal and typically include small recreation areas (e.g., pool, basketball court, playground), private security, and private trash collection. These minimal amenities make it difficult to think of Guaynabo's gated communities as being amenity-driven endeavors. However, regardless of the amenities, prestige is still valued and the fear of crime is still a considerable factor.

An increased fear of crime has led people to seek the security and homogeneity of a gated residence. During the 1980s, the public experienced an increasing awareness of crime as a result of

increasing unemployment and the transition to a post-industrial economy. At this time, media and news descriptions of violent crimes also contributed to a heightened sense of crime for Puerto Ricans (García-Ellín, 2009). From 1980 to 2005, violent crime rates increased in both Puerto Rico and in the United States, and although Puerto Rico reported lower annual violent crimes than the United States, crimes resulting in death were greater in Puerto Rico (Godoy, 2008). The increase in crime-related deaths likely brought about a new awareness of crime that legitimized the increase in gated communities in Puerto Rico (García-Ellín, 2009). For example, in interviews with high-ranking officers of the *Policía Municipal de Guaynabo* (Guaynabo Municipal Police), Suárez Carrasquillo (2009) found that residents of several non-gated communities requested increased patrolling and assistance in gating their neighborhoods in hopes of reducing crime.

Previously, Damstra (2001) argued that the state, notably local governments, favors gated communities because the developer pays the housing infrastructure and the cost is passed onto the homebuyer. In addition, citizens often form private neighborhood associations because local governments are unable to preserve property values or provide the desired level of services (McKenzie, 1994; Nelson, 2005). For example, in Malibu, California, a group of residents hired a private security company to keep non-residents off a public beach (Broad Beach), ultimately resulting in the privatization of a previously public space (Low, 2006). In a similar vein, several authors have suggested that neoliberalism, or the privatization of government and public space, has impacted the development of gated communities (McKenzie, 2005; Rosen & Razin, 2009). For example, in the city of Las Vegas, Bonanza Village, a previously non-gated community, was recently required by the municipality to become a privately governed residential community with a homeowner association (McKenzie, 2005). According to this account, developers, local governments and homebuyers drive the process of privatizing communities following a neoliberal logic (McKenzie, 2005). The increase of gated communities as a result of neoliberal policies is not exclusive to the United States. For example, Israel has also experienced an increase in the number of gated communities due to similar global trends in public policy (Rosen & Razin, 2009). In a recent report, García-Ellín (2009) describes how gated communities in the San Juan Metropolitan Area have led to the privatization of previously public spaces. Similarly, in Guaynabo, the municipality has served as an ally to private investors in residential housing by investing in infrastructure (e.g., roads, beautification projects, etc.) in these areas. These examples of restrictive urban planning and policies have transformed the public landscape in Puerto Rico, limiting access to public spaces.

In the 1980s, Guaynabo's economy and everyday life were in a process of transition and the people of Guaynabo were beginning to gate their existing communities by blockading streets. At that time, the local government and politicians embraced this change in ways that continue to influence Guaynabo today (Suárez Carrasquillo, 2009). Then, during the 1990s, a new municipal administration not only promoted gated communities, but also made it an integral part of its urban policy (Suárez Carrasquillo, 2009). Capitalizing on the increased fear of crime, desire to be protected from crime, and increased interest in prestigious living, the municipality of Guaynabo began a city marketing campaign that resulted in an Americanized, gentrified, and gated Guaynabo, resulting in the transformation of "Guaynabo" to "Guaynabo City" (Suárez Carrasquillo, 2009). Although there are other accounts describing how and why gated communities have arisen within the Caribbean (e.g., Mycoo, 2006), and how global, political, and economic factors have facilitated the local development of gated communities (Geniş, 2007), here, I argue that the rise of gated communities within Guaynabo is unique in that gating has coincided with a government-led city marketing campaign.

Methods

Sources utilized here include semi-structured interviews with the municipal elite and a member of the *Junta de Planificación* (Planning Board of Puerto Rico), conducted in 2006, and content analyses of municipal reports, planning board information, newspaper reports, and the US Census. These sources represent multiple layers of administration and life in Puerto Rico, including the Federal (US Census), the State (The Planning Board of Puerto Rico), and the Municipal (Financial and Administrative Activities Report, interviews, and newspaper reports) governments. One interview was conducted with a leading municipal advisor on gated communities, and another interview was conducted with a member of the Construction-Economics division of the *Junta de Planificación*. Since 1942, the *Junta de Planificación* is the state agency in charge of tracking and promoting development in Puerto Rico. Results are summarized throughout the text and in Table 1, and current photos of city marketing examples within Guaynabo are provided in Figs. 1–7.

Content analyses were conducted on the following documents: *Informe de las Finanzas y Actividades Administrativas* (The Financial and Administrative Activities Report) from the Municipality of Guaynabo, the “Selected Statistics of the Construction Industry 2006” generated by the *Junta de Planificación* (Planning Board of Puerto Rico, 2007), several newspaper articles from *El Nuevo Día* (highest audited circulation in Puerto Rico) (El Nuevo Día, 2011); Audited Circulation Report (2008) retrieved through the ADENDI digital archive, and to a lesser extent, the US Census.

Defining city marketing

City marketing is a process by which urban activities are focused on the demands of targeted consumers in order to maximize the efficient social and economic functioning of the targeted region



Fig. 1. Photograph of a street sign denoting Guaynabo's city limit. Source: Carlos A. Suárez Carrasquillo.

or area (Ashworth & Voogd, 1988). It is a tool that cities use to market themselves to a particular group or groups of people in order to attract investors and to promote interest in the city. To attract people, cities must also offer a variety of services such as public works and housing (Seisdedos, 2004). In order to thrive, municipalities keep in mind how their city is perceived by both citizens and future and potential clients. Often, municipalities tend to develop trademarks or slogans that are meant to give the city a personality and attempt to draw attention to the city's trademark (e.g., Suárez Carrasquillo, 2009).

Recently, marketing within the public sphere has been linked to public consumption and politics (Ozalp & Zwick, 2008), with a growing interest in the connection between consumption and the organization of urban space (Ozalp & Belk, 2009). For example, in

Table 1
Gated community housing developments in Guaynabo from 2000 to 2006.

Name of the development	Year	Classification	Total number of units	Average price (in US dollars)
Porto Fino	2000	Apartments	28	319,000
Regency Park*	2000	Apartments	110	170,000
Plaza Atiene	2000	Apartments	25	210,000
Condominio El Laurel	2000	Apartments	48	245,000
San Patrick	2000	Apartments	16	300,000
Grand View*	2000	Apartments	60	–
Monte Rey	2000	Apartments	142	140,000
Portal de Sofia	2002	Apartments	130	165,000
Meadows Tower*	2002	Apartments	32	–
Villas Las Mercedes	2002	Subdivision	54	400,000
Lincoln Park*	2002	Apartments	108	–
View Point*	2002	Apartments	80	–
Bosque de Torrimar	2002	Apartments	64	230,000
La Villa Garden*	2002	Apartments	274	197,000
Condominio El Laurel	2002	Apartments	48	245,000
Balcones de San Pedro	2002	Apartments	100	135,000
Il Vilagio	2002	Apartments	20	300,000
Palma Real	2004	Subdivision	180	675,000
Balcones de San Pedro	2004	Apartments	100	135,000
Regency Park (tower 1)*	2004	Apartments	198	200,000
Hill View*	2004	Apartments	80	290,000
Mirador las Torres	2006	Apartments	256	200,000
Condominio Dina Plaza	2006	Apartments	80	200,000
Murano Luxury*	2006	Apartments	196	425,000
Hacienda Elena (Phase A)	2006	Apartments	250	475,000
Vista Linda	2006	Apartments	12	480,000
Casa Magna	2006	Apartments	48	600,000
Plaza del Prado	2006	Apartments	100	600,000

Source: Department of Economic and Social Planning, Planning Board of Puerto Rico. Only developments with pricing information or those that are named in English are included. Developments market with an asterisk have English names and unavailable or missing information is denoted with a en-dash.



Fig. 2. Photograph of the municipality making use of three slogans. *Source:* Lisa S. Scott.



Fig. 3. Photograph of the entrance to Guaynabo's city hall. *Source:* Lisa S. Scott.



Fig. 4. Photograph of street signs in English. *Source:* Lisa S. Scott.

Toronto, developers are leading the process of attracting customers by depicting a community where a hipster and bohemian lifestyle is an amenity (Ozalp & Belk, 2009). Since the 1970s, and the development of Late Capitalism, post-Fordism, and Neoliberalism, lifestyles have increasingly become focused on the consumption of commodities. Recently, it has been suggested that life itself has turned into a business, where “everything becomes a commodity” (Gorz, 2010, p. 23). Both developers and cities take advantage of this non-material commodity, the former to sell their developments, and the latter to attract residents to their municipality.



Fig. 5. Photograph of a toy given to children by the municipality of Guaynabo during the 2009 Christmas season. *Source:* Carlos A. Suárez Carrasquillo.



Fig. 6. Photograph of the sponsors for Wi-Fi in Guaynabo Centro. *Source:* Lisa S. Scott.



Fig. 7. Photograph of the Guaynabo City Flea Market. *Source:* Lisa S. Scott.

This market logic is similarly being utilized in Guaynabo, where municipal policies have paved the way for the real estate business to boom, and for the local government to benefit from the

increased tax base and economic activity. During the 1990s, prestige communities became more prevalent in Guaynabo, as the city marketing campaign grew stronger. For example, as reported in Caribbean Business, housing developments built in Guaynabo in the 1990s doubled in price by 2002 (Ruano, 2002, p. C4).

City marketing in Guaynabo: strategies

The political context of Guaynabo features a strong municipal government and political stability that has allowed it to launch a city marketing campaign. Guaynabo can be characterized as a strong municipal government because of its efficient governing and effective implementation of policies relative to other municipalities in Puerto Rico (Suárez Carrasquillo, 2009). The pro-Statehood *Partido Nuevo Progresista* (New Progressive Party) has provided political stability to the municipality and has been in control of Guaynabo's city hall since 1968. In addition, the current mayor has been in power since the mid 1990s without any significant electoral opposition. The lack of political contestation by other parties has allowed the mayor to implement policies related to space and the marketing of space within the municipality. These policies have focused on three components. First, the municipality aims to market its ability to provide good public services (e.g., timely and efficient rubbish collection, good recycling programs, and a professionalized and efficient police force) and to be fiscally responsible. Second, the municipality has conducted a massive campaign to incorporate the English language into everyday life within Guaynabo, resulting in changing the city's name and the increased use of English throughout the city (e.g., Fig. 1). Finally, the municipality has increased efforts to attract high-income residents by supporting the construction of new gated communities within the city.

City marketing in Guaynabo: living in an "exceptional" city

Unlike most municipalities in Puerto Rico, Guaynabo functions autonomously (*Municipio Autónomo*) and has the capacity to design and implement clear strategies and policies. In 1991, Puerto Rico enacted the *Ley de Municipios Autónomos* (LMA), which was a law that, among other things, granted municipalities more flexibility in organizing and making decisions about their own space. During the interview process, I learned that in 1999, in collaboration with the Planning Board of Puerto Rico, Guaynabo developed the *Plan de Ordenación Territorial*, which allowed them to function autonomously and to develop policies about the use of their spaces. In 2000, Guaynabo obtained most of the capacities of an autonomous municipality, allowing for the ability to market its city in ways that attracted the real estate industry and potential clients. By the year 2005, the Municipality of Guaynabo achieved the *Jerarquía V* (Fifth Hierarchy), which is the highest degree of autonomy possible in the LMA scale (Rivera Marrero, 2005). With their new municipal responsibility, Guaynabo created the *Oficina de Permisos Urbanísticos y de Ordenamiento Territorial* (Office of Urban Permits and Territorial Ordinance) in order to assume the planning duties that were previously held by state agencies in San Juan.

Today, Guaynabo has evolved into a city that enjoys significant financial resources. According to the 2008 US Census, the average per capita income for Guaynabo was \$20,090, while the average for Puerto Rico was \$10,064 (US Census Bureau, 2006–2008b). This is increased from the 2000 US Census, which reported a per capita income of \$16,287 for Guaynabo's residents. As the expansion of the capital city of San Juan occurred, neighboring municipalities, like Guaynabo, attracted new subdivisions and buyers who had the interest and economic means to purchase new homes. This likely contributed to the municipality achieving a high per capita

income in comparison to other municipalities. However, there are also several other possible factors that set Guaynabo apart from other adjacent municipalities, such as differences in terrain make-up (a more hilly region), the presence of a US military base, and/or the make up of the immigrant population (e.g., post-revolutionary Cuban immigrants). However, these factors have yet to be empirically explored. In addition, here I argue that the city marketing campaign initiated by Guaynabo is also likely to have influenced the increase in per capita income from 2000 to 2008.

The municipality of Guaynabo has made a concerted effort to present itself to the public as an efficient and well-managed municipality. Héctor O'Neill, the Mayor of Guaynabo since 1993, often uses catchy slogans and phrases to refer to the municipality, such as *Ciudad de los Conquistadores* (City of the Conquistadores) or *Ciudad de Cinco Estrellas* (Five Star City) (see Fig. 2). The former makes reference to Caparra, the first Spanish settlement in Puerto Rico, which was located in today's Guaynabo. This marketing technique of making use of significant historical events or symbols has also been used in China (Pow & Kong, 2007) and Turkey's Kemer Country (Geniş, 2007). For example, in China, real estate advertisements have explicitly linked famous landmarks associated with elites from the Ming and Qing dynasties (Pow & Kong, 2007). Similarly, in Turkey, private real estate developers made use of a 15th century Ottoman aqueduct to symbolize their new housing development (Geniş, 2007).

A common thread highlighted throughout Guaynabo's *Informe de las Finanzas y Actividades Administrativas* reports (1996–1997, 2001–2002, and 2002–2003) were the past achievements and future plans of the municipality, including plans for public works, fiscal responsibility, and the offering of efficient public services. In the 1996–1997 report, the municipality boasts of how, in only 4 years, the current government was able to increase its income by 49%. According to this report, these increases were due to profits generated by property taxes and municipal licenses (*patentes municipales*; *Municipio de Guaynabo*, 1996–1997). They claimed that this places the municipality in a very good position to face the 21st century. In addition, in 1997, Mayor O'Neill was quoted as saying that the municipality "... collected over \$35 million in property taxes, which represents an increase of \$15.7 million over what was collected at the beginning of my municipal administration in the 1992–1993 fiscal year"¹ (Estrada Resto, 1997).

The 2001–2002 report highlights Guaynabo's great economic stability in a time when the government of Puerto Rico faced fiscal and economic stagnation (e.g., declining construction and reduced investment) (*Municipio de Guaynabo*, 2001–2002:20). Property taxes are reported as Guaynabo's main source of municipal income. The 2002–2003 financial reports highlight how revenue from property taxes increased from \$14,803,203 in 1993 to \$39,492,687 in 2003 (*Municipio de Guaynabo*, 2002–2003:5). The comparison specifically highlights the increase that has occurred since Mayor O'Neill started his tenure in Guaynabo.

These yearly reports are one way in which Guaynabo highlights an efficient municipality with novel amenities relative to neighboring towns and within the Puerto Rican context. Guaynabo markets its exceptionalism with the goal of generating a sense of pride in its residents and an *esprit d' corps* amongst its employees. For example, employees of Guaynabo are allocated significant resources (e.g., new equipment, new public service vehicles, etc.) to do their work and fuel their sense of belonging as part of this exceptional municipal culture. I contend that Guaynabo's strategic portrayal of their municipality in these reports serves as the foundation of a consolidated city marketing strategy. This strategy has led to changes in the population and an increase in prestigious and expensive gated communities.

¹ My translation.

City marketing in Guaynabo: the institutionalization of the English language

The use of the English language on public street signs, municipal buildings, vehicles and uniforms appears to be a concerted effort by the municipality to portray prestige to the Puerto Rican public. The municipality has replaced words on street signs and other public signifiers from Spanish, the native language of the population, to English. In Puerto Rico, English is the second official language but is not used by residents as frequently as Spanish. The US Census indicates in its 2006–2008 American Community Survey Estimates for the Puerto Rico Community that 95.2% of people 5 years and older primarily speak Spanish in the home (US Census Bureau, 2006–2008a). The mayor has claimed that the purpose of incorporating English in city signs is to familiarize residents with the language and to aid tourists and visitors who do not speak Spanish (Alvarado León, 2009). However, a popular thought is that these changes respond to the ideological preferences of a municipal administration that favors Puerto Rico joining the United States as the 51st State.² The paradox of the display of English in public space and the use of Spanish in the home is emblematic of Puerto Rico's colonial status.

Examples of changes made within Guaynabo include switching the “*Policía Municipal de Guaynabo*” to the “Guaynabo City Police” in 1999, and altering the police car doors to feature the English motto “Protect, serve, and maintain our quality of life” in 2008. When Ghigliotty and Cordero interviewed the mayor on this matter, he stated that it was his idea to label the police cars in English, but downplayed the situation, saying “that is not important”,³ and suggested that Guaynabo has among its residents an English speaking community (Ghigliotty & Cordero, 1999). By 2003, a newspaper article made open reference to how Guaynabo is now commonly known by its new name “Guaynabo City” (Rodríguez Cotto, 2003). In this same report, when asked why street signs are in English, the mayor indicated, “That is not important. I had them made in English since they are federally funded and people have liked them”^{4,5}. In addition, the signs welcoming people to the city have morphed from “*Bienvenidos a la Ciudad de los Conquistadores*” (translated to Welcome to the City of Conquerors) to “Guaynabo City Limit” and the “*Casa Alcaldía*” is now “City Hall” (see Fig. 3). Moreover, the stop signs have changed from what is typical in Puerto Rico, “Pare,” to “Stop,” and several other traffic signs were changed from Spanish to English (see Fig. 4). In the year 2009, the left or right turn only lanes changed from “Solo” to “Only.” Moreover, when municipal employees were asked by a journalist about who had ordered this change, they responded that the municipal *Departamento to Obras Públicas* (Public Works Department) had placed this order (Alvarado León, 2009). The municipality has also targeted the everyday lives of its residents. For example, toys given to youth during the traditional Christmas gift handout in 2009 read and featured an image of Guaynabo City Hall (see Fig. 5).

At the same time, the municipality increased its use of English

in public spaces, and English names and phrases increased within both public and private spaces, including gated communities, resulting in a new residential profile. Table 1 illustrates how, consistent with the increased use of English by the municipality, there is also an increased use of English in recent gated community developments (see names denoted in Table 1 with an asterisks). Many of the names chosen for these communities denote prestige in partial or total English (e.g., Murano Luxury, Regency Park). However, other languages are also used for names of these communities (e.g., Italian names: *Porto Fino* and *Il Villaggio*). In addition, when Spanish is used, the names make reference to prestigious neighborhoods in Guaynabo (e.g., Torrimar) or places of regal connotation (e.g., Monte Rey, Palma Real). I argue that these names are not accidental and that similar to the municipality's city marketing campaign, they seek to convey prestige.

City marketing in Guaynabo: a new residential profile

The municipality has used city marketing in an attempt to homogenize the residential profile of Guaynabo. Previously, it has been suggested that one reason residents are attracted to gated communities is because of the homogeneity of their residents (Low, 2003). The increase in gated communities within Guaynabo over the last decades has also resulted in an increasingly homogeneous residential population comprised of individuals within middle and upper socioeconomic classes. In an interview with one of the municipality's advisors on gated community affairs, I learned that elected officials in Guaynabo have actively supported gated communities from 1993 when Mayor O'Neill took office (Suárez Carrasquillo, 2009).

The strategy of building a more homogenous Guaynabo has not only been beneficial to the municipal government, but private capital also has had a vested interest in increased homogeneity. For example, recently, Mayor O'Neill described the origins of an alliance between his municipal administration and the private housing sector as beginning shortly after he took office. At this time, a developer claimed they were having difficulties selling their luxury villas within a golf community because of the narrow road that led to the development. In order to rectify this problem, the municipality agreed to invest approximately \$42 million to revamp the road. The developer contributed only \$28 million. The mayor describes this as the first of municipality's partnerships with the private sector (Santana, 2010, p. 47). This use of public money for the benefit of the private sector is similar to a recently reported pattern of neoliberal policies that promote the emergence of gated communities in Las Vegas (McKenzie, 2005) and Israel (Rosen & Razin, 2009). This focus on public–private partnerships within Guaynabo started with housing developments and has expanded to other sectors, including a recent partnership with WorldNet Telecommunications, Inc. to provide free Wi-Fi to the downtown area (see Fig. 6). In Guaynabo, the neoliberal policies of the municipality have been articulated through the public funding of private enterprises.

The use of city marketing by the municipality continues to change the profile of residents in Guaynabo. According to the US Census 2006–2008 Puerto Rico Community Survey, over 93% of Puerto Rican homeowners own homes valued less than \$300,000. Table 1 shows the average cost of units within gated communities built between 2000 and 2006 within Guaynabo. The average cost of living within one of these new developments is \$305,667 (ranges between \$135,000 and \$675,000), well above the cost of 93% of Puerto Rican homes from 2006 to 2008. This evidence suggests that new-gated communities within Guaynabo are primarily catering to wealthy residents. Table 1 also shows that the number of units within these communities varies widely and that the majority of the units are apartments relative to condominiums or walk-ups.

² Support for this view comes from a recent interview with Spanish literature professor and community activist, Dr. Ortiz-Lugo, where she described the “eccentricity” of using the English language in everyday life, within Guaynabo, as one of several attempts to promote a pro-Statehood political goal in Puerto Rico (Ortiz-Lugo, 2011).

³ My translation.

⁴ My translation.

⁵ In 1999, the Mayor argued that he ordered the patrol cars to be labeled in English. However, in 2003, he claimed that the English labels occurred by accident. O'Neill suggested that the municipality bought the patrols in the United States and to their surprise the doors read “Guaynabo City Police”. He also suggested that although the naming started as an accident, the name eventually grew on the community, serving as a source of pride that set Guaynabo apart (Rodríguez Cotto, 2003). Despite this inconsistency, the end result is that the patrols have continuously been labeled in English since 1999.

For the most part, units with apartments fall under the prestige classification, whereas the subdivisions are typically lifestyle communities with amenities (e.g., gymnasiums, recreation centers, pools, etc.).

Conclusion

The case of Guaynabo, Puerto Rico illustrates how government can play an influential role in promoting gated communities. During the early to mid 1980s, residents of the middle and upper class mobilized and lobbied with the municipality and Puerto Rican legislators in order to obtain support for gating their communities. At the same time, other communities took matters into their own hands and began to erect blockades without government consent. These events prompted the eventual passing of Law 21 in 1987, which legitimized and standardized the gating process. A decade later, under a new municipal administration, gated communities are thriving within Guaynabo's culture, where new developments are marketed to those seeking prestige and lifestyle living. Not only were new developments built with gates, but gating also occurred within existing neighborhoods and public housing in Guaynabo.

By the turn of the new century, the municipal government achieved administrative autonomy, allowing it more latitude to implement policies related to urban planning. City marketing was a tool used by the municipality to change the perception of Guaynabo. "Guaynabo City" now caters to middle- to high-income residents, resulting in the homogenization of its people and spaces. The pervasiveness of these efforts has normalized the usage of "Guaynabo City" in a variety of ways within Puerto Rican popular culture. Examples include newspaper headlines reporting *Guaynabo City abre la pluma de los millones* (Guaynabo City begins spending spree) (Martínez, 2010), the creation of a new and trendy magazine entitled "G City Magazine," the opening of the "Guaynabo City Flea Market" (see Fig. 7), and the musical satire *Estoy en bici en Guaynabo City* (Riding my bike in Guaynabo City) by the group *Los Niños Estelares*.⁶

The municipality's increased use of the English language (in a Spanish speaking country) in public spaces as well as efforts to provide efficient public service can also be seen as a form of city marketing. Now Guaynabo is perceived as an enjoyable place where public services and government operate efficiently, providing a quality of life exclusive to this Puerto Rican municipality. Other municipalities in Puerto Rico have now emulated Guaynabo's city marketing campaign. In 2009, the newly elected mayor of Guayama, Glorimar Jaime, proposed to rename city streets and plazas in English, emulating the recent changes in Guaynabo (Cortés Chico, 2009). Jaime argued that the move was an attempt to attract American tourists and to motivate Puerto Ricans to learn the English language. Other municipalities have also followed suit (e.g., Aguadilla, San Juan). Future investigations of this trend should consider whether or not these changes are cosmetic or whether they are indicative of a deeper cultural and urban transformation.

The findings reported here are consistent with several previous investigations highlighting the importance of marketing in the proliferation of gated communities (Geniş, 2007; Pow & Kong, 2007) and the influence of government led initiatives (McKenzie, 2005). In this article, I have argued that Guaynabo has had an active policy of supporting gated communities that helps portray a particular marketed vision of Guaynabo. In addition, this analysis suggests

that city marketing is an important factor to consider when analyzing the emergence and proliferation of gated communities.

In Guaynabo, city marketing is one of the methods employed by the municipality to attract a specific residential profile. A sense of prestige is promoted throughout the municipality by, among other things, referring to Guaynabo as a "Five Star City" and widespread use of the English language on signs and buildings. The municipality has also assisted developers in an effort to build expensive residential communities within Guaynabo. Understanding the factors that contribute of the rise and proliferation of gated communities in Guaynabo can inform our understanding of gated communities more generally. Specifically, future work in other regions should examine the role of the municipal government in the proliferation of these enclaves.

The colonial context of Puerto Rico likely contributed to the nature of Guaynabo's city marketing campaign. The use of the English language is the cornerstone of this campaign and is emblematic of the Puerto Rican colonial reality, where it is understood by many that the use of the English language confers a sense of prestige. This is exemplified by the English names given to new developments in Guaynabo (see Table 1). This is relevant because within Puerto Rico, there are contentious political debates over language and efforts of Americanization that have been promoted by some and resisted by others since 1898.

This investigation of Guaynabo contributes to the gated community literature by addressing the relevance of a city marketing campaign by a municipality, and the uniqueness of having this campaign within a colonial setting. To date, the gated community literature has been remiss in considering these elements as influential. Additionally, it will be important for future research to comparatively examine the role of city marketing in the emergence of gated communities in other municipalities in Puerto Rico. Since crime, prestige, gentrification, property values, tax collection and income differences are not exclusive to Puerto Rico, or the Caribbean, I propose that city marketing should be considered within the gated community literature beyond the Caribbean shores.

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank Lisa S. Scott for her patience, encouragement and her commitment to promoting rigorous academic work. I would also like to thank Dr. John Brigham, Dr. Laura Jensen, Dr. Ellen Pader, Dr. Nicholas Xenos, and Dr. George Roberson for comments and feedback on previous versions of this work. In addition, I would like to thank all of the generous staff at the Municipality of Guaynabo and the Puerto Rico Planning Board, and the staff at the Department of Economic and Social Planning of the Puerto Rico Planning Board for their time. Any errors in this document are all mine.

References

- Alvarado León, G. (2009). *Señales de tránsito en inglés, lo nuevo en Guaynabo City*. El Nuevo Día.com. Published on September 16, retrieved in June 23, 2010.
- Ashworth, G. J., & Voogd, H. (1988). Marketing the city: Concepts, processes and Dutch applications. *The Town Planning Review*, 59(1), 65–79.
- Bagaeen, S., & Uduku, O. (2010). *Gated communities: Social sustainability in contemporary and historical gated developments*. London: Earthscan.
- Blakely, E., & Snyder, M. (1997). *Fortress America: Gated communities in the United States*. Washington, DC: Brookings Institution.
- Caldeira, T. (2001). *City of walls: Crime, segregation, and citizenship in São Paulo*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.
- Cortés Chico, R. (2009). "The Witch City" tendrá su "Main Street". El Nuevo Día, January 15.
- Coy, M., & Pöhler, M. (2002). Gated communities in Latin American megacities: Case studies in Brazil and Argentina. *Environment and Planning B, Planning and Design*, 29(3), 355–371.
- Damstra, R. (2001). Don't fence us out: The municipal power to ban gated communities and the federal takings clause. *Valparaiso University Law Review*, 35, 525–560.

⁶ This song depicts through great sarcasm and wit Guaynabo's transition to a more gentrified municipality with an increase in gated communities and the use of the English language. The author thanks former student Nina Rodríguez Quirós for directing me to this song.

- El Nuevo Día. (2011) <<http://promos.elnuevodia.com/mediakit//mediakit/data/circulacion.pdf>> Retrieved 01.07.11.
- Estrada Resto, N. (1997). *Boyante Guaynabo*, *El Nuevo Día*, October 15.
- García-Ellín, J. (2009). Gated communities and housing projects: The control of public space in San Juan. *Southeastern Geographer*, 49(4), 354–375.
- Geniş, S. (2007). Producing elite localities: The rise of gated communities in Istanbul. *Urban Studies*, 44(4), 771–798.
- Ghigliott, J., & Cordero, G. (1999). *Guaynabo rotula 25 patrullas en idioma inglés*, *El Nuevo Día*, May 13.
- Glasze, G. (2005). Some reflections on the economic and political organisation of private neighborhoods. *Housing Studies*, 20(2), 221–233.
- Godoy, R. (2008). Is homicide in Puerto Rico high? *Homicide Studies*, 12(2), 188–207.
- Gorz, A. (2010). *The immaterial*. London: Seagull.
- Grant, J., & Mittelsteadt, L. (2004). Types of gated communities. *Environment and Planning B: Planning and Design*, 31, 913–930.
- LaCour-Little, M., & Malpezzi, S. (2001). Gated communities and property values. In *American real estate and urban economics association's meetings, paper presented in Washington, DC, Gävle, Sweden, Washington University–St. Louis, and University of British Columbia*.
- Low, S. (2003). *Behind the gates: Life, security, and the pursuit of happiness in fortress America*. New York: Routledge.
- Low, S. (2006). How private interests take over public space: zoning, taxes, and incorporation of gated communities. In S. Low & N. Smith (Eds.), *The politics of public space*. New York: Routledge.
- Martínez, A. (2010). *Guaynabo abre la pluma de los millones*, *El Nuevo Día*, June 12.
- McKenzie, E. (1994). *Privatopia: Homeowners associations and the rise of residential private government*. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- McKenzie, E. (2003). Private gated communities in the American urban fabric: emerging trends in their production, practices, and regulation. In *Paper presented at the gated communities: building social division or safer communities? Conference, University of Glasgow*, 18–19 September.
- McKenzie, E. (2005). Constructing the Pomerium in Las Vegas: A case study of emerging trends in American gated communities. *Housing Studies*, 20(2), 187–203.
- Municipio de Guaynabo (1996–1997). *Informe de las Finanzas y Actividades Administrativas del Municipio de Guaynabo*.
- Municipio de Guaynabo (2001–2002). *Informe de las Finanzas y Actividades Administrativas del Municipio de Guaynabo*.
- Municipio de Guaynabo (2002–2003). *Informe de las Finanzas y Actividades Administrativas del Municipio de Guaynabo*.
- Mycoo, M. (2006). The retreat of the upper and middle classes to gated communities in the poststructural adjustment era: The case of Trinidad. *Environment and Planning A*, 38, 131–148.
- Nelson, R. H. (2005). *Private neighborhoods and the transformation of local government*. Urban Institute Press.
- Ortiz-Lugo, J. (2011). *E-mail interview*. April 10–May 21.
- Ozalp, Y., & Belk, R. (2009). The role of consumption in the organization of urban space: The case of Neo-Bohemia. *Advances in Consumer Research: North American Conference Proceedings*, 36, 830–831.
- Ozalp, Y., & Zwick, D. (2008). Market and public sphere: Unpacking political consumerism. *Advances in Consumer Research: North American Conference Proceedings*, 35, 213–215.
- Planning Board of Puerto Rico (2007). *Selected statistics of the construction industry of the planning board 2006*. Commonwealth of Puerto Rico.
- Pow, C., & Kong, L. (2007). Marketing the Chinese dream home: Gated communities and representations of the good life in (post-) socialist Shanghai. *Urban Geography*, 28(2), 129–159.
- Quiles Rodríguez, E. (2003). *San Juan tras la fachada: Una mirada desde sus espacios ocultos (1508–1900)*. San Juan, Puerto Rico: Editorial Instituto de Cultura Puertorriqueña.
- Rivera Marrero, M. (2005). *Alcanza Guaynabo autonomía en la planificación*, *El Nuevo Día*, June 15.
- Rodríguez Cotto, S. (2003). *Un orgullo para Héctor O'Neill su 'City Police'*, *El Nuevo Día*, May 13.
- Rodríguez Juliá, E. (2008). *Such a Ville*, *La Revista*, December 7, p. 16.
- Rodríguez Villanueva, C. (1984). *Guaynabo: Notas para su historia*. San Juan: Oficina Estatal de Preservación Histórica de La Fortaleza.
- Rodríguez Villanueva, C. (1987). *Población y sociedad: estructura familiar en Guaynabo entre 1820 y 1869*. Unpublished Masters thesis, Universidad de Puerto Rico–Río Piedras.
- Rosen, G., & Razin, E. (2009). The rise of gated communities in Israel: Reflections on changing urban governance in a Neo-liberal Era. *Urban Studies*, 46(8), 1702–1722.
- Ruaño, L. E. (2002). *Fidalgo expects explosive growth in Guaynabo housing*, *Caribbean Business*, October 3, p. C4.
- Safa, H. (1974). *The urban poor of Puerto Rico: A study in development and inequality*. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, Inc..
- Santana, M. (2010). *Guaynabo achieves astonishing growth as infrastructure developer: Mayor O'Neill spurs development to jumpstart the city's economy*, *Caribbean Business*, July 29.
- Seisdedos, H. (2004). City marketing: El Camino Hacia la Ciudad Emprendedora. *Revista de Empresa*, 8, 54–64.
- Suárez Carrasquillo, C. (2009). *City marketing and gated communities: A case study of Guaynabo, Puerto Rico*. Unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, University of Massachusetts, Amherst, MA.
- Thuillier, G. (2003). Gated Communities in the Metropolitan Area of Buenos Aires (Argentina): A challenge for town planning. In *Paper presented at the gated communities: building social division or safer communities? Conference, University of Glasgow*, 18–19 September.
- US Census Bureau (2006–2008a). *American Community Survey, estimates for the Puerto Rico Community Survey, Percent of people 5 years or older who speak other language than English at home*.
- US Census Bureau (2006–2008b). *American Community Survey, estimates for the Puerto Rico Community Survey, median housing value of owner-occupied housing units 2008*.
- Webster, C. (2001). Gated cities of tomorrow. *The Town Planning Review*, 72(2), 149–170.
- Webster, C. (2002). Property rights and the public realm: Gates, green belts and Gemeinschaft. *Environment and Planning B, Planning and Design*, 29, 397–412.
- Wilson-Doenges, G. (2000). An exploration of sense of community and fear of crime in gated communities. *Environment and Behavior*, 32(5), 597–611.
- Wu, F., & Webber, K. (2004). The rise of “foreign gated communities” in Beijing: Between economic globalization. *Cities*, 21(3), 203–213.