

TERRACES, TREES, AND THE HAITIAN PEASANT:

AN ASSESSMENT OF

TWENTY-FIVE YEARS OF EROSION CONTROL

IN RURAL HAITI

GERALD F. MURRAY

Prepared for USAID/Haiti

AID-521-C-99

October, 1979

#### ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This research has entailed the gathering of information on 19 Soil Conservation Projects in five regions of Haiti. During the course of visits to these regions I have received assistance and hospitality from large numbers of people. Special acknowledgment must be made to the assistance provided by Michael Stapleton, Gaspard Brice, and Ronald Smith, who have participated actively in different phases of this research. In addition I wish to thank Matthew Anderson, Andy Barnes, Brissonor Comeau, David Cuttrell, David Gardener, Wilma Klein, Andre Leontas, Efrain Pareja, Nicolas Pierre, Occius Plaisil, Elias Tamari, Mary Ellen Tamari, Eleanor Turnbull, Wallace Turnbull, Jr. and Ronald Weaver. The information in these pages stems from conversations and/or long interviews with over a hundred farmers and project technicians, to whom I wish to express a collective thank you. I am especially indebted to William and Leslie Sugrue for their hospitality during several bouts of illness in the course of the research.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<u>PART ONE: EXECUTIVE SUMMARY AND INTRODUCTION</u>	Page
<u>Chapter One: Conclusions and Recommendations</u>	2
1.1 Conclusions	2
1.11 Major General Conclusions	2
1.12 Organizational, Motivational, and Educational Considerations	8
1.13 Technical and Operational Considerations	12
1.14 Land Tenure Considerations	13
1.15 Institutional Considerations	16
1.2 Recommendations	19
1.21 General Recommendations	19
1.22 Operational Recommendations	21
1.23 Project Design Recommendations	24
<u>Chapter Two: Objectives and Methodology</u>	26
2.1 Research Objectives	26
2.2 The Variables Investigated	28
2.3 Methodological Approach	31
2.4 Guiding Hypothesis of the Presentation	37
2.5 Structure of the Presentation	39
<u>PART TWO: CASE STUDIES</u>	41
<u>Chapter Three: Anatomy of a Success</u>	42
3.1 Mountain Vegetable Gardening and Erosion Control	43
3.2 Earlier Development Projects	45
3.3 Fertilizer and the Evolution of Agrarian Technology	52
3.4 Summary of Strengths and Weaknesses	55

<u>Chapter Four: A Composite Failure</u>	60
4.1 A Project Begins	60
4.2 The Question of Payment	62
4.3 Establishing Initial Contact	64
4.4 The Demonstration that failed	65
4.5 The Building of Walls	68
4.6 The Unwanted Grass	71
4.7 The Planting of Trees	75
4.8 The Systematization of Tree Pushing	78
4.9 The Problem of Recalcitrant Landowners	80
4.10 The Root of the Failure	84
<u>PART THREE: ANALYSIS OF PROJECT ELEMENTS</u>	88
<u>Chapter Five: Institutional Variables</u>	89
5.1 Institutions and Soil Conservation	90
5.11 DARNDR and ONAAC	90
5.12 International Development Agencies	93
5.13 International Relief Agencies	100
5.14 Local Missionary Groups	102
5.15 U.S. Based Contract Agencies	103
5.2 Project Task Analysis: Functions of the Implementing Agencies	106
5.3 Major Operational Shortcomings	113
<u>Chapter Six: Organizational Variables</u>	124
6.1 Soil Conservation and Community Groups	124
6.11 Rise of Collector-Distributors	125
6.12 The Community Council	129
6.13 The <u>Ekip</u> : Ephemeral Work Gang	130
6.14 Characteristics of the Ideal Group	131
6.2 Payment vs. Voluntary Participation	133
6.3 Money for Work vs. Food for Work	140
6.4 How should the Currency be Distributed?	146
6.5 Day Labor vs. Contract Labor	150

Chapter Seven: Technical Variables

7.1	Reforestation vs. the Use of Structures	154
7.2	Combining Reforestation with Wall Building and Terracing	157
7.3	Species-Selection Decisions	158
7.31	Consulting the Farmers	158
7.32	Wood Trees vs. Fruit Trees	160
7.33	Peasant Taxonomy of Wood Trees	163
7.4	Site Selection Decisions	164
7.5	Private Woodlots vs. Communal Forests	166
7.6	Nursery Decisions	168
7.7	Planting Decisions	172
7.71	Timing of the Planting	172
7.72	Spacing of the Trees	173
7.73	Selecting Ecologically Appropriate Trees	174
7.74	The Organization of Tree Planting	175
7.8	Surveillance and Protection of Newly Planted Trees	177
7.81	Livestock: Major Source of Danger	178
7.82	Other Sources of Danger	183
7.9	Project Measures Against Destruction	184
7.10	Other Erosion Control Structures	186

PART FOUR: SOCIOCULTURAL ANTECEDENTS OF EROSION CONTROL 192

Chapter Eight: Land Tenure and Soil Conservation 193

8.1	Overview of Haitian Peasant Land Tenure	193
8.2	The Issue of Land Tenure Insecurity	196
8.3	Land Tenure and Contour Mounds	200
8.4	Managers, Tenants, and Trees	201
8.5	Undivided Inheritance Land: Major Project Hindrance	202

<u>Chapter Nine: Culture and Conservation</u>	208
9.1 Formulation of the Question	208
9.2 Culture and Deforestation	208
9.3 Culture and Tree Planting	217
9.4 The Short-Term Future: Investment for Profits	219
9.5 The Intermediate Future: Preparation for Old Age and Death	221
9.6 The Long-Term Future: Concern for the Next Generation	223
 BIBLIOGRAPHY	 228
 APPENDICES	
A. Observations of the Costs and Benefits of Different Tree Species (Ronald Smith)	231
B. The Costs and Benefits of Different Types of Nurseries (Ronald Smith)	237